Susan Haag

From:

Miller, Matthew (SHB)

Sent:

Wednesday, December 14, 2005 4:11 PM

To:

'Ray Beckerman'; Losasso, Ian C. (SHB)

Cc:

M. Ty Rogers; CowanLiebowitzPenneyMaryann (E-mail)

Subject:

RE: Lindor

Ray,

Thanks for your e-mail. I got your message yesterday but didn't have time to call you back about it.

Our clients do not want to pursue the wrong person for the copyright infringement that incurred in this case, and we recognize and appreciate your desire to avoid expense in this case. We, too, would like to work this out informally. According to our normal practice, we are willing to discuss either a global settlement of this matter or attempt to negotiate a settlement directly with the actual infringer in the case; but here, your client and her family roundly disavow any involvement in the infringement. Their denials aside, we think it is pretty clear that, at the end of the day, the individual who used the "jrlindor@kazaa" username is someone named Lindor. Given the specificity of the username, all signs point to Junior Lindor as the likely infringer.

We would be happy to negotiate directly with Junior about settling this lawsuit. Perhaps you could put us directly in touch with him to discuss these issues?

Otherwise, I think we need to see some proper discovery responses in this case setting forth what Ms. Lindor knows, when computers were in her house and when the internet account was active, and what kind of investigation she has done into these issues. Even if your statements about her involvement are true, she may still be secondarily liable in this case, and we need to explore that avenue before we agree to dismiss her. We would like to depose Mr. Raymond and Junior Lindor on these issues as well.

Depending on what we find out during that discovery, we will decide whether to dismiss Ms. Lindor without prejudice. But at the moment, without this information, we are not in a position to dismiss our case against Ms. Lindor.

If we cannot do this informally, we would like to hear from you when we can expect proper discovery responses on Ms. Lindor's behalf. We would also like to work with you to schedule the depositions of these three individuals. Would you please let us know?

Matthew C. Miller Shook, Hardy & Bacon L.L.P. 2555 Grand Blvd. Kansas City, Missouri 64108-2613 Telephone (816) 474-6550 Direct (816) 559-2075 Facsimile (816) 421-5547

----Original Message----

From: Ray Beckerman [mailto:RBeckerman@BLHNY.com]

Sent: Tuesday, December 13, 2005 4:28 PM

To: Losasso, Ian C. (SHB)

Cc: M. Ty Rogers; Miller, Matthew (SHB); CowanLiebowitzPenneyMaryann

(E-mail)

Subject: RE: Lindor

Dear lan,

You can call me Ray.

I've spoken to Matt about resolving this matter informally and was trying not to incur any legal fees. I think we're pretty much all agreed that Marie Lindor, who has never owned and wouldn't even know how to turn on a computer, isn't your culprit. We've been trying to figure out who jrlindor is.

There was no working computer at all at the house in August 2004, so whoever it was either brought a laptop or otherwise went in over the wireless router that was still there after the computer which had been there had been removed. There is a Lindor relative named "Junior" who might have been at the house but who didn't have a laptop computer.

Of course it would be a good idea to postpone discovery, but I think it would be a better idea to discontinue without prejudice since it is clear that Marie Lindor didn't do it.

Woody Raymond is a responsible guy and will be available to answer your questions, formally under oath, or informally, so you don't need to keep the case open as a discovery device, and I don't think it's really appropriate to pursue a case just for that purpose.

Best regards,

Ray

----Original Message----

From: Losasso, Ian C. (SHB) [mailto:ILOSASSO@shb.com]

Sent: Tuesday, December 13, 2005 2:56 PM

To: Ray Beckerman Subject: Lindor

Mr. Beckerman,

We served Ms. Lindor with discovery requests back in June. We received her responses which were deficient in many respects. We wrote her a letter on 9/28 requesting her to supplement her responses. To date, we have not received anything from her. Please let me know when we can expect to see something.

In addition, we should consider lengthening discovery by 2 months to make this matter a little less deadline-driven.

Finally, we'd like to depose Ms. Lindor, Mr. Raymond, and Junior Lindor as soon as possible. Please let us know when they will be available.

We look forward to hearing from you.

Thank you,

Ian Losasso

"MMS <shb.com>" made the following annotations on 12/13/05 13:55:57

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This e-mail message including attachments, if any, is intended for the person or entity to which it is addressed and may contain confidential and/or privileged material. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message. Thank you.

EXHIBIT K

- 1 Lindor
- 2 they got the last name.
- Q. I'm looking for people who go by
- 4 Junior Lindor. I think your son told me
- 5 there is at least one or maybe more Gene
- 6 Lindors who go by Junior, is that true?
- 7 A. Yeah.
- Q. Do you know, there are two in Haiti
- 9 who your son wasn't sure if they were
- 10 children of a cousin or children of his uncle
- 11 Justav, your brother.
- Does your brother have children who
- 13 go by Junior Lindor?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Is it just one child?
- 16 A. Yeah. One boy, one girl.
- 17 Q. The boy goes by Junior Lindor, is
- 18 the boy's name Justav?
- 19 A. Yes, they have the same name.
- Q. There are juniors who are named
- 21 Gene, who are they? There are a couple of
- 22 Gene Lindors who, if I understood correctly,
- 23 go by Junior?
- A. One is my brother, so his son.
- Q. Your brother's name is Gene?

	Page 1									
]									
	2	A. Yes.								
	3	Q. He has a son named Gene?								
	4	A. Junior.								
	5	Q. Gene Junior?								
	6	A. Yeah.								
	7	Q. Your brother's full name is Gene or								
	8	is it Eugene?								
	9	A. No, my brother name Gene Lindor.								
	10	Q. Is that spelled G-E-N-E?								
	11	A. G-E-N-E, he lives in Connecticut,								
	12	his son lives in Connecticut, but he has								
	13	nothing to do with the kids. They live in								
	14	Connecticut maybe more than 15 years.								
	15	Q. So there you have a brother								
:	16	named Gene and he has a son named Gene that								
=	L 7	goes by Junior, is that right?								
]	L8	A. Yes.								
]	.9	Q. And then there is your brother								
2	0 :0	is Justav?								
2	1	A. But they don't								
2	2	Q. You have a brother Gene who is in								
2	3 (Connecticut, and he has a son named Gene who								
2	24 goes by Junior, correct?									
2	5	A. Yes.								
	_									

- 1 Lindor
- Q. Then you have a different brother
- 3 named Justav, who has a son named Justav who
- 4 goes by Junior?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Where does your brother Justav
- 7 live?
- 8 A. I can't tell you where he live.
- 9 Q. Do you know what state he lives in?
- 10 A. I know where I'm living, but I
- 11 can't tell you where my brother live.
- Q. Does he live in the United States?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. You don't know where he lives?
- 15 A. No.
- Q. Do you know where his son Justav
- 17 Junior lives?
- 18 A. I don't know.
- 19 Q. Are there any other Junior Lindors,
- 20 that you know of?
- 21 A. No.
- Q. You have described for me all of
- 23 the Junior Lindors that you know?
- 24 A. Yes, I do.
- Q. Thank you.

24

25 Denis?

Q.

- 1 Lindor
- 2 make me confused.
- Q. So the record is clear, Mr. Raymond
- 4 indicated it's difficult for Ms. Lindor to
- 5 talk about her husband who passed away.
- 6 A. It's better just Lindor, don't
- 7 mention it, please.
- Q. Ma'am, do you speak other languages
- 9 besides English?
- 10 A. Yes, I do.
- 11 Q. What other languages?
- 12 A. I speak Padua and English.
- 13 Q. Your son gave me -- strike that.
- I asked about people who have lived
- 15 with you in your home, I asked Mr. Raymond
- 16 about that, and he indicated to me that in
- 17 2004 and 2003 your daughter Kathy lived in
- 18 the home, although she lived with him
- 19 sometimes when she was going to school, is
- 20 that right?
- 21 A. Correct.
- 22 Q. Did anybody else live in your home
- 23 in 2004?
- 24 A. No.
- 25 Q. So it was just --

- 1 Lindor
- 2 A. By myself.
- Q. And is your daughter's name Kathy,
- 4 I thought I saw Kathleen somewhere?
- 5 A. Yeah, Kathleen Raymond, Kathy
- 6 Raymond.
- Q. Her birth name was Kathleen, yes?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. My daughter is named Kathleen, too.
- 10 Did anyone live in the house with
- 11 you who was not related to you for --
- 12 A. No, no, no, I live by myself. I
- 13 always at home, 12 hours a day, I leave about
- 14 6:30, I come home at 10:30, sometimes seven
- 15 days.
- Q. Ma'am, to your knowledge, has
- 17 anyone besides your family access to your
- 18 home, keys --
- 19 A. No, no, my son have a key and my
- 20 daughter have a key, nobody outside, it's my
- 21 private.
- 22 Q. Your son is Mr. Raymond?
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. You said your son, you have two
- 25 sons?

	Page 59
	STATE OF NEW YORK)
3	: SS.
4	COUNTY OF NEW YORK)
5	
6	I, LESLIE FAGIN, a Notary Public
7	within and for the State of New York, do
8	hereby certify:
9	That MARIE LINDOR, the witness
10	whose deposition is hereinbefore set
11	forth, was duly sworn by me and that
12	such deposition is a true record of the
13	testimony given by the witness.
14	I further certify that I am not
15	related to any of the parties to this
16	action by blood or marriage, and that I
17	am in no way interested in the outcome
18	of this matter.
19	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
20	set my hand this 25th day of July, 2006.
21	Viale Log
22	Vi rum V
23	LESLIE FAGIN
24	
25	

EXHIBIT L

1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK 2 3 UMG RECORDINGS, INC., a Delaware corporation; WARNER BROS. RECORDS INC., a Delaware 4 corporation; ARISTA RECORDS LLC, a Delaware limited liability company; INTERSCOPE RECORDS, a 5 California general partnership; MOTOWN RECORD COMPANY, L.P., a California limited partnership; and SONY BMG MUSIC ENTERTAINMENT, a Delaware 6 general partnership, 7 Plaintiffs, 8 -against-9 MARIE C. LINDOR, 10 Defendant. 11 12 110 East 42nd Street 13 New York, New York 14 August 25, 2006 10:50 a.m. 15 16 17 DEPOSITION of KATHLEEN RAYMOND, the 18 Nonparty Witness herein, taken by Plaintiff, 19 pursuant to Notice, held at the above-noted time 20 and place before a Notary Public of the State of 21 New York. ELLEN GRAUER COURT REPORTING CO. LLC 126 East 56th Street, Fifth Floor

New York, New York 10022 212-750-6434

REF: 81706

22

23

24

25

1 RAYMOND 2 home that you can recall? 3 I'm not sure. Α. 4 All right. Now, let me ask you, was 0. 5 that computer in the home at all --6 MR. GABRIEL: Strike that. 7 Q. Was the computer in the house at all 8 times when you lived there, except for when maybe 9 it was being repaired? 10 Α. Yes. 11 All right. At the time you lived in 0. 12 that home with your mom, has anyone else lived 13 there? 14 Α. No. 15 Your brothers were all gone already? 0. 16 Α. Yes. 17 Yanick is a sister, right? Q. 18 Α. Yes. 19 Q. She was gone as well? 20 Α. Yes. 21 Other than your family, did any Q. 22 relatives come and stay for any periods of time, 23 more than just a couple of days? 24 Α. Not that I'm aware of. 25 Q. All right. Basically, the times you

1 RAYMOND 2 lived in the house, the people who lived there 3 were you and your mom and I take it your dad up until the time he passed away? 4 5 Α. Yes. 6 Ο. That's true? 7 Α. Yes. 8 Q. Who used the computer in that house 9 that you're aware of? 10 Α. In my mother's house? 11 Q. Yes. 12 Α. My father. 13 And you as well? Q. 14 Α. Yes. 15 Q. I don't want you to guess at any question I ask you. Okay. So if you don't know, 16 17 you just tell me you don't know. 18 Α. Okay. 19 Do you know what your dad used the Q. 20 computer for? 21 Α. No. 22 Q. Did you ever see your dad using the 23 computer? 24 Α. Yes.

Again, without guessing, did you ever

25

Q.

1	RAYMOND
2	A. No.
3	Q. Did you ever see any of your siblings
4	use that computer?
5	A. Yes.
6	Q. Who?
7	A. My sister.
8	Q. That's Yanick?
9	A. Yes.
1,0	Q. Okay. What did Yanick use that
11	computer for, if you know?
12	A. Type her papers.
13	Q. Anything else?
14	A. Not that I'm aware of.
15	Q. Did you ever see any of your brothers
16	use that computer?
17	A. No.
18	Q. Now, you've told me you've seen your
19	dad use the computer when he was with us, and
20	you've used it, and your sister Yanick has used
21	it.
22	Have you ever seen anyone else use
23	that computer?
24	A. No.
25	Q. I asked you a specific question

1 RAYMOND 2 whether you knew of relatives that go by the name 3 JR Lindor or Jr. Lindor. Do you know anyone who 4 goes by the name JR Lindor? 5 Α. No. 6 Ο. Do you know anyone who goes by the 7 name Jr. Lindor? 8 No. Α. 9 0. Do you know anyone who has used as an 10 e-mail address or screen name or user name --11 Α. No. 12 -- JR Lindor? Q. 13 Α. No. 14 How about Jr. Lindor, same? Q. 1.5 Α. No. 16 Tell me about how frequently did you Q. 17 use the computer in your mom's home; were you on 18 there every day, was it once a day, once a month? 19 Α. Whenever the printer at my brother's 20 house wasn't working. I just go there to print 21 out my paper. That's it. 22 Q. Would you put a disc and take it on 23 over? 24. Α. Yeah.

How often would that happen?

25

Q.

CERTIFICATE

STATE OF NEW YORK)
SS:
COUNTY OF NEW YORK)

I, ELLEN KATZ, a Shorthand Reporter and Notary Public in and for the State of New York, do hereby certify:

That the testimony of KATHLEEN RAYMOND was held before me at the aforesaid time and place.

That said witness was duly sworn before the

commencement of the testimony and that the

testimony was taken stenographically by me and is

a true and accurate transcription of my stenographic notes.

I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to the action by blood or marriage and that I am in no way interested in

the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 31st day of August, 2006.

Ellen Katz, BPR, CRR

Kathleen Raymond

October 12, 2006

Holme Roberts & Owen LLP 1700 Lincoln Street, Suite 4100 Denver, CO 80203 Attn: Richard L. Gabriel, Esq.

Re: UNG Recordings, Inc. v. Lindor

Dear Mr. Gabriel:

Enclosed please the transcript, with the following changes:

a- page 66, line 7 to "protect my interest. I'm going to object to."

b- page 58, line 8 to "A mouse, verizon modem/router, speaker, printer, and a box similar to the verizon modem/router with antenna (wireless router)."

c- page 58, line 12 to "yes, not exactly, my knowledge is limited to my experience at Radioshack."

dpage 58, line 14, to "yes - Because my knowledge is based on my experience from working at Radioshack and the products they carried, I associated a router to a device made by Linksys, Netgear, D-Link routers and thought that they are the only three companies that made router. After I got home that day, I realized Belkin also made wireless router. Therefore, a wireless router was present at that time."

COUNTY OF NEW YORK)

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

I, KATHLEEN RAYMOND, hereby certify that I have read the transcript of my testimony taken under oath in my deposition of August 25, 2006; that the transcript is a true, complete and correct record of what was asked, answered and said during this deposition, and that the answers on the record as given by me are true and correct.

Subscribed and sworn to before me this 12 day of 0006.

NOTARY PUBLIC

STATE OF NEW YORK)

WOODY A. RAYMOND
Notary Public, State of New York
No. 01 RA6024275
Qualified in Kings County
Commission Expires May 3, 20

ERRATA

ELLEN GRAUER COURT REPORTING CO. LLC 126 East 56th Street, Fifth Floor New York, New York 10022 212-750-6434

TO

REASON

NAME OF CASE: UMG RECORDINGS VS. LINDOR DATE OF DEPOSITION: August 25, 2006 NAME OF WITNESS: KATHLEEN RAYMOND PAGE

FROM

65 1 T	<u> ५९६ ५</u>	dg Cs	
66 17 1	Take	1 obsat To	1 Clasification
58 181	5ce	1 etter	1 Clarification
581131	Sec	1 ette	1 Clasification
581141	<u> 500</u>	12+406	1 classication
			1
		l	ļ
		1	f
		1	I
			[
	**************************************	' '	

Subscribed and sworn before me

LINE

WOODY A. RAYMOND
Notary Public, State of New York
No. 01RA6024275
Qualified in Kings County
Commission Expires May 3, 20

EXHIBIT M

UMG RECORDING INC., et al v. Lindor ED - NY Case Number: 05-cv-1095

Supplemental Declaration and Expert Report

Dr. Doug Jacobson, Ph.D., CFCE

Ph.D. Computer Engineering Certified Forensic Computer Examiner International Association of Computer Investigative Specialists

Qualifications & Prior Testimony

1) I am employed as an associate Professor of Electrical and Computer Engineering at Iowa State University and as the Director of the Iowa State University Information Assurance Center. I also have an appointment with the Iowa State University police department where I aid in computer forensics.

2) In addition, I am the Chief Technical Officer and founder of Palisade Systems, a high-tech computer security company that specializes in network monitoring and

filtering technologies.

3) My employment with Iowa State University began in 1982 as a computer programmer. I completed my Ph.D. in Computer Engineering with a focus in computer networking in December 1985. In January 1986, I was hired by the Department of Electrical and Computer Engineering as an Assistant Professor to teach and research in the area of computer networks. Since that time, I have taught over 25 classes in computer networks at both the undergraduate and graduate level. I have received over 5 million dollars in funding for my research and have written several articles and made numerous presentations on the topic.

4) In 1995, I created and taught one of the first computer security classes at Iowa State University and in the country. Under my guidance, in 1999, Iowa State University was recognized by the National Security Agency as a center of excellence. And in 2000, the Iowa State University Information Assurance Center was created. I am its first and only director. I am a Certified Forensics Computer Examiner. My Curriculum Vitae is attached as Exhibit (A)

5) On September 9th 2003, I testified in front of the U.S. Senate Judiciary Committee on

the uses of peer-to-peer protocols.

Prior Experience

6) I have been teaching computer networking since 1986 and written papers and performed research on computer networks.

7) I have given over 50 presentations on computer security and networks at conferences, workshops, and various meetings.

- 8) I hold two patents in the area of computer network security and have won two R&D 100 awards for technologies I developed at Palisade Systems. One of these technologies is designed to detect and block peer-to-peer network protocols in addition to over 100 other network protocols.
- 9) I have assisted the Iowa State University Police department on several computer cases including cases using peer-to-peer networks to distribute pirated software and child pornography.
- 10) One of my graduate students, under my supervision and guidance, developed a system that monitors peer-to-peer networks and other forms of file-sharing for child pornography.
- 11) My rate for analysis and testimony is \$200.00 per hour. Additional expenses relating to analysis, testimony, and travel are reimbursed at the incurred costs.

Hard Drive Forensics

12) This case involved the examination of a hard drive. Several terms need to be defined relative to a hard drive examination.

Current Internet History—Internet history on the computer that has not been altered. This history can be tied to a specific user account on the computer, if the operating system permits it.

Forensically Sound – The preservation of evidence surrounding a case such that the evidence is kept exactly the way it was received. In computer terms, "forensically sound" relates to the preservation of the state of the data – no information has been added, edited or removed from the forensic media during the examination.

Initiating Party – The party that brings the forensic media in for analysis, and provides the scope of the investigation to the investigators.

Internet Cache — A location on a piece of media that contains downloaded images, movies, sounds and web pages of locations users have visited on the Internet. The Internet Cache is often cleared to make more space available on the media, and can be configured to be emptied when the user closes the Internet browser.

Investigators – Those performing the forensic analysis of the media for the specified parameters.

Media – The items that contain digital evidence, which are brought to the investigators for analysis. Media includes, but is not limited to, hard drives, USB devices, CD-ROM's, floppy discs, ZIPTM discs and DVD's.

Past/Removed Internet History – Internet history on the computer that had to be recovered from unallocated (deleted) file space.

Unallocated Space – When files are deleted from media, references to them are removed, but the actual data may still exist on the media. Unallocated space is the term used to describe any part on the media where a file may have existed. Since unallocated space is eventually overwritten, the usage of the computer dictates how long a deleted file will exist here.

13) The hard drive examination followed several steps as outlined below, which are consistent with the process outlined by the International Association of Computer Investigative Specialists.

Evidence Acquisition Phase

During the acquisition phase, the initiating party provides the investigators with relevant media associated with the case. The initiating party also provides investigators with information surrounding the investigation that will be applied in the analysis stage. Once the media is delivered to the investigators, proper documentation is signed indicating the media transfer.

Evidence Preservation Phase

During the preservation phase, an exact, forensically sound copy is made of each medium obtained in the acquisition phase. This ensures the original media is not tainted in any way. Further, hash values are created of the original media, and compared against the copies, to ensure that the copied data accurately represents the original media. This keeps the forensic process sound.

Analysis Stage

During the analysis stage, information that relates to the case is searched for over all the media obtained. This information is retrieved during the acquisition phase. This ensures that the investigators are only looking for information pertaining to this case. Investigations outside these parameters will not take place, unless otherwise explicitly stated by the initiating party.

Conclusion Stage

The conclusion stage will draw together everything analyzed in the analysis stage. Here, the investigator will review the recovered data, and provide explanations of why the data exists where it does, and how the data relates to the case.

Materials Considered

- 14) I have reviewed the underlining investigative data for the Lindor case. This includes all of the data supplied by MediaSentry. I also have reviewed information supplied by Defendant's Internet Service Provider (ISP) Verizon Internet Services. Below is a list of the materials I considered in developing my conclusions.
 - a) MediaSentry Screenshots
 - b) MediaSentry Systemlog
 - c) MediaSentry UserLog (compressed)
 - d) MediaSentry UserLog
 - e) MediaSentry Download Logs
 - f) Certificate of Registration
 - g) MediaSentry Trace
 - h) Verizon Internet Services subpoena response
 - i) Disk drive image from defendant's computer

Conclusions

In addition to the conclusions contained in my report dated April 7th 2006 I have the following additional conclusions based on the additional information from the hard drive image.

- 15) I will testify to the procedures used and results obtained by MediaSentry coupled with the information supplied by Defendant's ISP, to demonstrate the Defendant's Internet account and computer were used to download and upload copyrighted music from the Internet using the KaZaA peer-to-peer network.
- 16) I will testify that based on the MediaSentry data mentioned above and registry entries recovered from the computer that the computer had a public IP address and was not connected to the Internet via a wireless router.
- 17) I will testify based on the forensics examination that the computer had three usernames of interest that were named Kathleen, Woody, and Yanick.
- 18) I will testify that I found very few user created files and saved emails on the hard I was provided to by the defendant.
- 19) I will testify that based on the data recovered from the hard drive provided by the defendant that the users Woody, Kathleen, and Yanick accessed the Internet using the computer.
- 20) I will testify that based on the data recovered from the hard drive that this hard drive does not appear to be the same hard drive that was used to share copyrighted songs as shown by the MediaSentry materials. I will testify based on the forensics examination of the hard drive that was copied from the computer owned by the defendant that the computer had no evidence of the KaZaA program nor was there any evidence of the KaZaA program ever being installed on the computer, although the MediaSentry data showed the computer connected to the defendant's Internet account was running the KaZaA program.

- 21) I will testify based on the data recovered from the hard drive produced by the defendant that the computer had a Western Digital 100 GB USB external hard drive connected to it and that the external hard drive was first connected on or before 7/8/2004. The external drive was not provided by the defendant.
- 22) The user Woody used Windows MediaPlayer to access songs and other files from a directory:
 - (F:\h\Documents and Settings\Yanick\My Documents\download\yayahq) located on the external hard drive.
- 23) I will testify that based on the data recovered from the hard drive that the user Woody was administer of the computer.
- 24) I will testify that based on the data recovered from the hard drive provided by the defendant that several email addresses were associated with users on the computer including: wraymond yanick wright, kathleen, yayagq, yanick ray.
- 25) I will testify that based on the data recovered from the hard drive provided by the defendant that the yahoo account jeanlindor was accessed using the computer.
- 26) I will testify that the computer contained the resume of Gustave Lindor, Jr and that the document indicates he was living and working in Brooklyn N.Y. and working at Long John Silver's during the dates that the copyrighted music was being shared.
- 27) I reserve the right to review additional discovery materials, as they are made available for my review, and use any of the material considered as exhibits in my testimony.

Attachments:

Doug Jacobson – Curriculum Vitae – Exhibit (A)

I declare under penalty of perjury and the laws of the United States that foregoing is true and correct. Executed this 15 day of December, 2007, at 9:00 and

Dr. Doug Jacobson

EXHIBIT N

_	l																
2	บท	ľľ	E) :	ST	ΥA	E	S	D:	I S	T	RI	CJ	ľ	СО	U.	RT
3	ΕA	SI	EF	N	D	I S	T	RI	C	r	01	F	N E	EW	Y	0	RK
4	-	-	-		-	_		-		_		-	-	-	-		_

UMG RECORDINGS, INC., a Delaware Corporation; WARNER BROS. RECORDS, INC., a Delaware Corporation; ARISTA RECORDS LLC, a Delaware Limited Liability Company; INTERSCOPE RECORDS, a California general partnership; MOTOWN RECORD COMPANY, L.P., a California limited partnership; and SONY BMG MUSIC ENTERTAINMENT, a Delaware general partnership,

Plaintiffs,

-against-

MARIE C. LINDOR,

Defendant.

19

20 21

22

23 24

25

885 Third Avenue New York, New York

October 22, 2007 10:20 a.m.

EXAMINATION BEFORE TRIAL of GUSTAVE LINDOR, a Non-Party Witness in the above-entitled action, held at the above time and place, taken before Jennifer

```
1
                    G. Lindor
  2
          Α
                 Yes, sir.
  3
                Did your family get together at
  4
      Christmas time?
  5
                Yes.
          Α
 6
                You saw Woody at Christmas
 7
      time?
 8
          Α
                Yes.
 9
          Q
                Does your family usually get
10
      together at Christmas time?
11
          Α
                Yes.
12
                So pretty much every year you
13
     all get together?
14
          Α
                Yes.
15
                When you get together, where do
          Q
16
     you get together?
17
               At Woody's house.
18
                And you're talking about
         Q
19
     Woody's house, separate from his mother's
20
     house?
21
         Α
                Yeah.
22
                Not your Aunt Marie's house,
         Q
23
     Woody's house?
24
         Α
                Yeah.
25
                As best you can remember, so
         Q
```

1.	G. Lindor	. 4
·. 2	Q You said that you had lived in	
3	this house on East 108th Street in	
4	Brooklyn since 2003?	
5	A Yes.	
6	Q Did your cousin Woody know	
7	where your lived?	
8	A No.	
9	MR. ROGERS: Can you put a time	
10	frame?	
11	MR. GABRIEL: Sure, I'll do	
12	that.	
13	Q Since you lived at the East	
14	108th Street address, had your cousin	
15	Woody known where you lived?	
16	A No, sir.	
17	Q How did he know how to invite	
18	you to the Christmas party?	
19	A He told Yannick.	
20	Q I thought you said Woody	
21	invited you?	
22	A Woody invited me, so he has to	
23	tell Yannick.	
24	Q To your knowledge, did Woody	
25	know you lived in Brooklyn?	

		25
1.	G. Lindor	23
2	A Yes.	
3	Q When is the last time that you	
4	saw your Aunt Marie?	!
5	A I already answered that	ļ
6	question.	
7	Q I'm not sure that you did, but	
8	could you try again?	Í
9	You said you saw her once every	
10	five years or so?	·
11	A Yeah.	
12	Q Has it been five years since	
13	you have seen her? I'm asking a bit of a	
14	different question.	
15	When is the last time you saw	
16	her?	
17	A Since 2001.	
18	Q Was there some reason you saw	
19	her in 2001?	
20	A She was sick. She had a	
21	sickness, so I came by to visit.	
22	Q And did you go by her home?	
23	A Yes.	
24	Q And she was in Brooklyn at the	
25	time?	

```
G. Lindor
  1
  2
          A
                 Yes.
  3
                 To your knowledge, did your
          Q
  4
      Aunt Marie know you lived in Brooklyn,
  5
      even though you don't see her?
  6
                 Yeah.
          A
 7
          Q
                 Mr. Lindor, do you live with
 8
      anybody?
 9
          Α
                 Yes, sir.
10
                Who do you live with?
11
          Α
                My mother and my sister and my
12
      stepfather.
13
                What is your mother's name?
          Q
14
          A
                Jacqueline Lindor.
15
                Can you spell Jacqueline?
          Q
16
          A
                J-A-C-Q-U-E-L-I-N-E.
17
                And her last name is Lindor?
          0
18
                Yes, sir.
         A
19
         Q
                What is your sister's name?
20
                Shirley Lindor.
         Α
21
                Would you spell Shirley?
         Q
22
                S-H-I-R-L-E-Y.
         A
23
                And what is your stepfather's
         Q
24
     name?
25
                Al.
         A
```

```
1
                    G. Lindor
  2
      remember things that you didn't.
  3
                 Do you think you saw her in
  4
      2005, 2006?
  5
          Α
                 No.
                 So she wasn't in her house
 6
          Q
 7
      then?
          Α
                 No.
 8
                 So let me be clear. You do
 9
          Q
      remember being in your Aunt Marie's house
10
     New Year's Eve 2005?
11
12
          Α
                Yeah.
13
                And you are now thinking she
          Q
14
     was not there; is that right?
15
          Α
                Yes.
16
                Do you remember who was there?
          Q
17
          A
                Yannick and Kathleen Raymond.
18
                Woody was not there?
          Q
19
          Α
                No.
20
                Anybody else there?
          0
21
                No.
         A
22
                Did Yannick invite you over?
         Q
23
         Α
                Yes.
24
                And before that, do you
         Q
     remember the last time when you were in
25
```

212-267-6868

1	G. Lindor
2	please.
3	[The photograph was hereby
4	marked as Exhibit 5, for
5	identification, as of this date.]
6	Q Mr. Lindor, I'm showing you
7	what we marked as Exhibit 5 to your
8	deposition.
9	Is that you?
10	A Yes, sir.
11	Q I'll tell you this is a
12	photograph that your aunt provided to us
13	in this case.
14	Do you know when this picture
15	was taken?
16	A I don't remember.
17	Q Do you know how old you were in
18	that picture?
19	A I don't remember.
20	Q It looks like you're on an
21	airplane, does that help you any?
22	A I'm not sure.
23	Q Mr. Lindor, do you have any
24	nicknames; are you known by any other
25	names?

```
1 .
                    G. Lindor
  2
          Α
                 Junior.
  3
                 Who calls you Junior?
          Q
  4
          Α
                 Everybody.
  5
                 Do you have any other nicknames
          0
      besides Junior?
  6
  7
          Α
                 No, sir.
 8
          Q
                 Do you ever use a computer?
 9
          A
                 Yes.
10
                And have you used e-mail?
          Q
11
          Α
                E-mail, once.
12
                Or instant messages, do you
          Q
13
     know what instant message is?
14
          A
                No, sir.
15
                When you said you used e-mail,
          Q
16
     did you have an e-mail address?
17
          Α
                Yes.
18
                What was your e-mail address?
         Q
19
                G dot Lindor.
         Α
20
                G dot Lindor?
         0
21
         A
                Yeah.
22
                Any other e-mail addresses that
         Q
23
     you've used?
24
                No, sir.
         Α
25
                Forgive me, a personal
         Q
```

1 ·

CERTIFICATION

I, JENNIFER BRENNAN, a Shorthand
Reporter and a Notary Public, do hereby
certify that the foregoing witness, was
duly sworn on the date indicated, and
that the foregoing is a true and accurate
transcription of my stenographic notes.

I further certify that I am not employed by nor related to any party to this action.

Jennyer Brennan

JENNIFER BRENNAN

EXHIBIT O

COUNTY O)F	COURT		ED STATES DIS ERN DISTRICT					
UMG RECO		ET AL.				<u> </u>	Index No	. 05CV1095	-DGT-RML
MARIE C.	LINDOR		age	ainst		Plaintiff(s)			IDAVIT OF OF SUBPOENA L CASE
STATE OF NEW	YORK, COUN	TY OF NEW	YORK		SS: The unde	ersigned being	z dulv swor	n denoses and	says; deponent is not
party herein, i	•		d resides	at NORTH BRUN	ISWICK, NEW	JERSEY		-	•
deponent serv	=	n subpoena o		•	VE LINDOR,		Kirisi Di	KOOKLIN, I	witness therein named
MOIVIBUAL 1.				id witness persona	ally; deponent kr	new the perso	n so serve	d to be the w	itness described in said
CORPORATION 2.	a personally	y, deponent	knew sa	orporation, by delivable aid corporation series.			ion witne	ss and knew	said individual to be
BUTTABLE AGE PERSON 3. FFIXING TO BOOR, ETC.	and discre	a true copy	emises is to the do	s witness'—actual oor of said premise	es, which is witn	ess'-actual	place of bu	nal place of all siness—dwell	person of suitable age pode—within the state ling place—usual place
4. 🗵	of abode—	-within the s	tate. Dep	onent was unable. SO LEFT A CO	with due diliger	nce to find wi	itness or a	person of suit	able age and discretion
	ATTEMPTS	4-20-0 4-24-0 4-25-0 4-28-0 5-18-0	7 AT 8 7 AT 6 7 AT 5 7 AT 7	3:30 A.M. 5:15 A.M. UNII 5:50 A.M. UNII 7:00 A.M. UNII 6:30 A.M. UNII 6:00 P.M. UNII	IL 9:15 A.M. IL 9:00 A.M. IL 9:00 A.M. IL 9:30 A.M.	5- 5- 5-	21-07 A' 24-07 A'	r 5:15 P.1 r 5:20 A.1	4. AT 9:30 P.M. 4. AT 9:30 A.M. M. AT 5:30 A.M.
MAILING TO RESIDENCE USE WITH 3 OR 4 SA. X	at witness'	last known r	esidence,	, at 1443 EAST 10	8TH STREET, E	ROOKLYN,	NEW YORK	: 11236 #6E	rly addressed to witness and deposited n New York State.
	addressed to in an officia the legend	witness at values witness at values of the witness of the witness at values at values of the witness of the wit	vitness' a under the id Confid	actual place of bus exclusive care and dential" and did n	iness, at I custody of the I ot indicate on tl	J.S. Postai Se ne outside the	rvice within	n New York S eturn address	tate. The envelope bore or otherwise, that the 07 AT 6:00 P.M.
DESCRIPTION USE WITH 1, 2, OR 3	□ Male □ Female	☐ White ☐ Black: ☐ Yellow	Skin / Skin	☐ Black Hair ☐ Brown Hair ☐ Blonde Hair	□ White Hai□ Balding□ Mustache	☐ 21-35 ☐ 36-50	Yrs. [Yrs. [Under 5' 5'0"-5'3" 5'4"-5'8"	☐ Under 100 Lbs. ☐ 100-130 Lbs. ☐ 131-160 Lbs.
		☐ Brown ☐ Red Sk		☐ Gray Hair ☐ Red Hair	☐ Beard☐ Glasses	☐ 51-65 ☐ Over	_	☐ 5'9"-6'0" ☐ Over 6'	☐ 161-200 Lbs. ☐ Over 200 Lbs.
(Other identi	fying feature	s:						
at the time of sai worn to before 6/4/07		ponent paid	Noi Qu	JOHN DICANI SOHN DICANI Pary Public, State of No. 01 DI49777 alified in Westchest mission Expires Feb	O New York 68 er County	the authoriz	C.	ANG GINES	
			Hos	レガ				License No.	845419

COUNTY			ED STATES DISERN DISTRICT				
UMG RECO	ORDINGS, ET	AL.	٧	Ple	Inde	x No. 05CV1095	
MARIE C.	. LINDOR	aį	gainst	Defe	ndant(s)		DAVIT OF OF SUBPOENA L CASE
STATE OF NEV	V YORK, COUNTY O	F NEW YORK		**************************************	<u> </u>		
party herein,	is over 18 years o		s at NORTH BRUI	NSWICK, NEW J	ERSEY	•	says; deponent is not a
	/31/07 ved the within sub L CASE	ppoena on	•	at 1262 HANCOC VE LINDOR, JR		ROOKLYN, NEW	YURK #3 witness therein named
				•			
1.	subpoena	a true copy to s	aid witness person	ally; deponent knev	v the person so s	erved to be the wi	tness described in said
CORPORATION 2.	a personally, de	eponent knew:	orporation, by deli- said corporation s hereof.	vering thereat a true so served to be th	copy to e corporation w	itness and knew	said individual to be
SUITABLE AGE PERSON 3. AFFIXING TO DOOR, ETC 4. AF	by delivering thereat a true copy to a person of suitable a and discretion. Said premises is witness'—actual place of business—dwelling place—usual place of abode—within the sta						ing place—usual place
MAILING TO RESIDENCE USE WITH 3 DR 4 SA. XX	at witness' last	known residence	e, at 1262 HANCOCK	nt enclosed a copy of STREET, BROOKL	YN, NEW YORK	11221 #3	rly addressed to witness and deposited in New York State.
MAILING TO BUSINESS USE WITH 3 OR 4 58.	in an official dep the legend "Per	tness at witness' pository under the sonal and Conf	actual place of bus e exclusive care an idential" and did r	iness, at d custody of the U.S not indicate on the	6. Postai Service voutside thereof,	within New York S by return address	tate. The envelope bore or otherwise, that the D7 AT 6:00 P.M.
DESCRIPTION USE WITH 1, 2, OR 3		Black Skin Yellow Skin Brown Skin Red Skin	 □ Black Hair □ Brown Hair □ Blonde Hair □ Gray Hair □ Red Hair 	□ White Hair□ Balding□ Mustache□ Beard□ Glasses	☐ 14-20 Yrs. ☐ 21-35 Yrs. ☐ 36-50 Yrs. ☐ 51-65 Yrs. ☐ Over 65 Yr	☐ Under 5' ☐ 5'0"-5'3" ☐ 5'4"-5'8" ☐ 5'9"-6'0" s. ☐ Over 6'	☐ Under 100 Lbs. ☐ 100-130 Lbs. ☐ 131-160 Lbs. ☐ 161-200 Lbs. ☐ Over 200 Lbs.

EXHIBIT P

```
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
     EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK
     Case No. 05 CV 1095 (DGT) (RML)
 5
 6
    UMG RECORDINGS, INC., et al,
 7
 8
                                  Plaintiffs,
 9
10
          - against -
11
12
    MARIE LINDOR,
13
14
                  Defendant.
15
16
                  July 3, 2007
17
                  10:35 a.m.
18
19
                 Default deposition of GUSTAVE
    LINDOR, JR., taken by Plaintiffs, pursuant
20
    to Subpoena, held at the offices of
21
    Robinson & Cole, LLP, 885 Third Avenue,
    New York, New York, before Jineen Pavesi,
22
    a Registered Professional Reporter,
    Registered Merit Reporter, Certified
23
   Realtime Reporter and Notary Public of the
    State of New York.
24
```

```
2 recognized that he received the subpoena
                                                    2
                                                             EXHIBITS
 3 and he has not appeared.
            One more thing I did forget to
 5 note on the record as well.
                                                       EXHIBIT
                                                                   DESCRIPTION
                                                                                       PAGE
            The suppoena did indicate that,
                                                    6
 7 as I said, Mr. Lindor was to bring any
                                                    7
                                                       1
                                                              subpoena
 8 computers, et cetera, with him. We do
                                                    8 2
                                                             three returns of service 5
 9 have two technicians here who are prepared
                                                    9 3
                                                             letter that Mr. Lindor
                                                   10
10 to do a mirror image of the inspection so
                                                             sent
11 the plaintiffs have incurred costs for
                                                   11
12 that, they have incurred the costs for the
                                                   12
13 court reporter and they have of course
                                                   13
                                                   14
14 incurred my cost to fly here from Denver
                                                   15
15 for this deposition.
                                                   16
            With that I have nothing
16
                                                   17
17 further.
                                                   18
18
            (Time noted: 10:41 a.m.)
19
                                                   19
                                                   20
20
                                                   21
21
                                                   22
22
                                                   23
23
                                                   24
24
                                                   25
25
                                                7
                                                    1
 1
                                                    2
                                                           LITIGATION SUPPORT INDEX
 2
       CERTIFICATION
                                                    3
 3
 4
                                                        DIRECTION TO WITNESS NOT TO ANSWER
                                                    5
 5
                                                    6
                                                      Page/Line
    I. Jineen Pavesi, a Registered
    Professional Reporter, Registered Merit
                                                    7
                                                       NONE
 7
 8 Reporter, Certified Realtime Reporter and
                                                        REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS
                                                    9
 9 a Notary Public, do hereby certify that
10 the foregoing transcript is a true and
                                                   10 Page/Line
                                                   11 NONE
11 accurate transcription of my stenographic
                                                   12
12 notes.
                                                      INFORMATION TO BE FURNISHED
    I further certify that I am not employed
                                                   13
13
14 by nor related to any party to this
                                                   14
                                                      Page/Line
                                                       NONE
15 action.
                                                   15
                                                   16
16
                                                       Attorney Mr. Gabriel from Holme Roberts &
                                                   17
17
                                                       Owens LLP has retained all exhibits.
18
                                                   19
19
                                                   20
20
                                                   21
21
                                                   22
       JINEEN PAVESI, RPR, RMR, CRR
22
                                                   23
23
                                                   24
24
                                                   25
25
```

stipulations between Counsel.

24

```
2
       APPEARANCES:
                                                            WOODY RAYMOND, called as a
                                                        3
                                                            witness herein, having first been duly
         HOLME, ROBERTS & OWEN, LLP
         Attorneys for Plaintiffs
                                                            sworn by the Notary Public, was examined
              1700 Lincoln Street
                                                            and testified as follows:
              Denver, Colorado 08023
                                                       6
                                                            EXAMINATION BY
         BY:
              RICHARD L. GABRIEL, ESQ.
                                                       7
                                                            MR. GABRIEL:
   7
                                                       8
                                                               0
                                                                    Good afternoon, Mr. Raymond.
         VANDENBERG & FELIU, LLP
                                                       9
                                                               Α
                                                                    Good afternoon.
   8
         Attorneys for Defendant
                                                      μo
                                                               0
                                                                    Please state and spell your name
              110 East 42nd Street
              New York, New York 10017
                                                      11
                                                            for the record.
              RAY BECKERMAN, ESQ.
                                                      12
                                                                    Woody Raymond.
  10
                                                                    Tell us your home address,
                                                      13
                                                               0
  11
        ALSO PRESENT
                                                            please?
  12
        Matthew Oppenheim
                                                               Α
                                                                    817 East 21st Street, Brooklyn,
  13
        Richard Altman, Esq.
                                                      16
                                                            New York.
  14
                                                      17
                                                                    What is your business address?
 16
                                                      hв
                                                               Α
                                                                    I don't own a business.
 17
                                                      Ц9
                                                               Q
                                                                    Are you employed?
 18
                                                      20
                                                               Ā
                                                                    Yes
 19
 20
                                                      21
                                                               Q
                                                                    Tell us the address where you
 21
                                                      22
                                                           work.
 22
                                                      23
                                                                    250 East 57th Street, New York,
                                                              Α
 23
                                                      24
                                                            New York.
 24
 25
                                                      25
                                                              Q I know you've been through the
                                                   3
                                                                                                        5
  1
                                                                    W. RAYMOND
  2
              STIPULATIONS
                                                           process before. Do you still work for
  3
        IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, by
                                                       3
                                                           Lissner & Lissner?
  4
                                                       4
      and among counsel for the respective
      parties hereto, that the filing, sealing
                                                       5
                                                                   Now, I know that you understand
      and certification of the within deposition
                                                       6
                                                           some of the deposition process from being
      shall be and the same are hereby waived;
                                                       7
                                                           in the legal industry. It's very
        IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED
                                                       8
                                                           important that you hear and understand the
      that all objections, except as to form of
                                                       9
                                                           questions that are asked of you. If for
10
      the question, shall be reserved to the
                                                      10
                                                           any reason you don't hear a question I ask
11
      time of the trial;
                                                     11
                                                           you, please just tell me that.
12
        IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED
                                                     12
                                                                  All right.
                                                              Α
13
      that the within deposition may be signed
                                                     13
                                                                   That includes if you just get
1.4
      before any Notary Public with the same
                                                     14
                                                           distracted at all. Please don't be
15
      force and effect as if signed and sworn to
                                                     15
                                                           embarrassed. Tell me if you don't hear a
16
      before the Court.
                                                     16
                                                           question.
17
                                                     17
                                                                  Similarly, if you don't
18
                                                     18
                                                           understand a question, you'll tell me
19
                                                     19
                                                           that?
20
                                                     20
                                                              Α
21
                                                     21
                                                              0
                                                                   Based on that, if you answer a
22
                                                           question that I asked you, I'll presume
23
                                                     23
                                                           that you understood it and heard it. Is
24
                                                     24
                                                           that fair to you?
                                                                  Yes.
```

Last week, no.

You've looked at documents in

25

25

counsel?

Α

Yes.

5 (Pages 14 to 17)

25

could recollect.

frame here.

7 (Pages 22 to 25)

messenger service to bring it over?

25

8 (Pages 26 to 29)

		-		
	3	4		36
1	W. RAYMOND		1	W. RAYMOND
2	A As I told you before, this	-	2	1000BB, that existed as of July 2004?
3	document is different.		3	A If you recall, you haven't
4	Q My question is: Have you seen		4	produced those yet. As I told you before,
5	the first page of Exhibit 16 before?	- 1	5	I can't recall that information without
6	A This whole document is totally		6	you producing that document.
7	different.		7	MR. GABRIEL: Mark this as the
8	Q So the answer is no, you have	- 1	8	next exhibit.
9	not seen the first page?	- 1	9	[Whereupon, the above mentioned
10	A For the record, I cannot answer	- 1	LO	document was marked W. Raymond's
11	this question.	- 1	L 1.	Exhibit 17 for identification.]
12	Q Do you know how to read the	- 1	L2	Q I'm showing you Exhibit 17 from
13	first page of Exhibit 16?	- 1	L3	your deposition. Flip through this. Have
1.4	A I am not an expert, so you tell	- 1	L4	you seen this letter to your lawyer
15	me.	1	L5	(handing)?
16	Q Where it says device hierarchy,		16	[Witness peruses the document.]
17	you see a reference that says disc drive		.7	A I don't recall.
18	and some letters and numbers?		.8	Q There's some attachments here.
19	A Some letters I see letters		.9	The third page in is a copy of what was
20	and numbers. What is it, device?		20	the first page of Exhibit 16 with some
21	Q Based on your experience as an		1	notes. Did you notice that? Do you see
22 23	IT person, do you understand what those		2	arrows on it, the third page of Exhibit
24	mean? A I don't have the information to		3 4	17?
25	A I don't have the information to answer that question properly.		5	A Um-hmm. Q Yes?
-		_		
l	3!	۱ ۹		37
1	W. RAYMOND	-	1	W. RAYMOND
2	Q So then the answer is you don't		2	A Yes.
3	know?		3	Q There's some arrows. Had you
4	A I don't have the information to		4	seen that document before? Does that
5	answer that question properly.	-	5	refresh your memory that you've seen it
6	Q Mr. Raymond, what information		6	before?
7	would you need to answer the question		7	A I don't recall.
8	properly?	- 1	8	Q Then I indicated to you a moment
9	A As an IT person, you search for	- 1	9	ago whether you recall that we produced
10 11	information. You don't base your		.0	documents showing that a Western Digital
12	information if you don't know	1	_	external hard drive model number 1000BB
13	something, you look it up.	1		existed before July of 2004. Looking at
13 14	Q You did some research into a	þ		the page you're on, the fourth page of
15	Western Digital hard drive, correct? A Did I do some research? Yes.	1		Exhibit 17, do you now remember that we
16		i		produced such documents?
16 17	Q You produced some documents to show there was no Western Digital external	i		A You haven't produced such documents pursuant to the Court order.
18	hard drive in existence as of a certain	h		Q We produced documents showing
19	date. Do you remember that?	1		model 1000BB. It's a yes or no question?
20	A My research consisted of, there	2		A The document you produced is
21	was no Western Digital external hard drive	2		redacted, so I can't answer that question.
22	produced prior to July 2004.	2		Q There's no redactions on that
23	Q Did you see documentation from	2		document, sir.
24	our side back that showed there was a	2		A Something's blacked out.
25	Western Digital hard drive, model number	2		Q We didn't do that. Do you see

number 1000 BB. Are you not able to tell

me today, or do you deny that there was no

article.

you, there's nothing redacted from the

	42	T	44
1			
		2	***************************************
3	arre in crasterice scrote sary or	3	I produced
4	200	4	Q initial, my question is
5		5	more were carer pages in the accument
6		6	and you produced and you didn't give me
7		7	relating to other Western Digital drives,
8		8	correct?
وا	sassificity, and you have you,	وا	MR. BECKERMAN: Objection to form of the question.
10		10	
11	/ de got min to change mo	11	z procusou usoumento persuanti
12	TOTAL DESIGNATION TO THE POLICE	12	
13		13	drive by Western Digital.
14	***** ***************************	1	Q That wasn't the question,
15		14	Mr. Raymond. I understand the Court
16		15 16	order.
17	that requires a witness to adopt	17	A The question is misleading.
18	documents. He has no idea where you got them from. You could testify	18	Q It's not misleading at all,
19	about whatever you want.	19	Mr. Raymond. In the same document you're
20	MR. GABRIEL: I am not	20	looking at, there were lists of drives
21	testifying about anything.	21	that were not external hard drives; isn't
22		22	that right?
23	Q It's actually part of a document, Mr. Raymond, that you produced,	23	A There were lists of
24	is it not? You produced a listing of	24	Q Other Western Digital drives,
25	Western Digital drives, at least pages	25	correct? A That is correct.
F	43	<u> </u>	A That is correct.
۱.			
1	W. RAYMOND	1	W. RAYMOND
2	regarding external drives, correct? You	2	Q The page you're looking at now,
3	gave them to me.	3	the last page of Exhibit 17, it's one of
4	A That is correct, but this	4	those pages, true?
5	document	5	A I have no information where you
6	Q The answer is yes. You did not	6	get this data from. I can't confirm that.
7	produce other pages of that same document	7	I don't have that information in front of
9	that showed other Western Digital drives, correct?	8	me.
10		9	MR. GABRIEL: Mark this as the
11	A I produced documents to show all the external hard drive produced by	10 11	next exhibit.
12		12	[Whereupon, the above mentioned
13		13	document was marked W. Raymond's
14		14	Exhibit 18 for identification.]
15		15	Q I will show you what was marked
16		16	as Exhibit 18 (handing).
17		17	Do you recognize this as a
18		18	declaration that you prepared in this case and filed with the Court?
19		19	[Witness peruses the document.]
20		20	A Yes.
21		21	Q In paragraph
22		22	MR. GABRIEL: Strike that.
23		23	Q Mr. Raymond, look at paragraph
24		24	three of Exhibit 18, please, your
25	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	25	declaration.

13 (Pages 46 to 49)

the scope of the Court-ordered

25

was a Western Digital 100-gigabyte hard

		_		
	5	0		52
1	W. RAYMOND		1	W. RAYMOND
2	deposition. This was ordered to take	1	2	the apparent discrepancy between what
3	place on the issue of external hard		3	you said and what Mr. Raymond said,
4	drives, and you're opening some other	•	4	and that's why we're here. We're here
5	area, trying to cover up for the fact		5	to talk about the external hard drives
6	that your witness made a your		6	and nothing else.
7	expert witness made a mistake of some	1:	7	MR. GABRIEL: So you are
8	kind, and you're trying to pin it on	8	8	objecting to me asking him about
9	somebody else, other than him.	9	9	anything, other than an external hard
μo	MR. GABRIEL: The order says no	μo	0	drive?
111	such thing. I've asked twice now, or	1.2	1	MR. ALTMAN: I see there's no
12	three or four times	12	2	relevance to it. If it's going to
р3	MR. ALTMAN: The order	13	3	turn into a deposition about internal
14	MR. GABRIEL: Guys, we're going	1.4	4	hard drives, then yes. If you want to
15	to call the judge right now,	1.5	5	ask a couple of questions, fine.
16	[A recess was taken.]	16		There's no relevance to any issue
17	MR. GABRIEL: Back on the	17		concerning internal hard drive.
18	Record.	μ8		MR. GABRIEL: Well, first of
1.9	Is it your position that I am	19		all, I think we're splitting hairs on
20	not permitted to ask any questions	20		external and internal. I am not clear
21 22	about external hard drive today? That	21		on your position, Richard. I believe
23	may be directed to Mr. Altman or	22		I am entitled to ask about hard
24	Mr. Beckerman.	23		drives. I don't believe the judge
25	MR. BECKERMAN: Well, my	24 25		intended to limit it to external. The
ř—	position is if you asked a couple of		·	question again is whether you object
	51	-		53
1	W. RAYMOND	1	Ĺ	W. RAYMOND
2	very targeted precise questions not	2	•	to my asking about external hard
3	meant to blur the distinction between	3	}	drives.
4	external and internal, then I wouldn't	4	-	MR. ALTMAN: Your assertion
5	object to it as long as you don't	5		that is the sole basis for his
6	spend all day on it. Don't try to	6		appearance for the deposition. He's
7	make it that he misspoke when he was	7		told you in a declaration that he
8 9	talking about external hard drives and	8		doesn't have one, that he never had
10	you're talking about internal hard	9		one, that he didn't install one, and
11	drives.	10		moreover, it doesn't exist. That's
12	MR. GABRIEL: Well, Richard already told me	12		the scope of this deposition.
13	MR. BECKERMAN: It's easier to	13		MR. GABRIEL: So you're
14	have the questions on the record.	14		objecting. Let's call the judge. MR. ALTMAN: What do you want
14 15 16	MR. ALTMAN: I agree, but this	15		to ask about external hard drives?
16	is not going to turn into	16		MR. GABRIEL: I've been trying
17	MR. BECKERMAN: I am not going	17		to ask the same question for an hour.
18	to tell what you to do.	18		MR. ALTMAN: You're
19	MR. ALTMAN: This is not going	19		exaggerating. It has certainly not
20	to turn into an attempt to deny his	20		been an hour.
21	prior testimony. The judge said this	21		MR. GABRIEL: From the hard
22	was about an external hard drive.	22		drive produced to us, 100-gigabyte
23	That's what he was ordered to produce.	23		Western Digital hard drive, model
24 25	He said he didn't have one. The judge	24		number 1000BB, I've been trying to ask
45	said that you could question him about	25		repeatedly for a while at least to

question.

the question.

to confirm them or not, but nothing in the

the best of your knowledge and

computer, other than the one that

1 W. RAYMOND 2 computer. Correct me if it's wrong. 3 A It's correct. 4 Q So it's correct that you were with your father when he bought the computer? 7 A Yes. 8 Q So we know he bought the computer before August of 2001? 10 A Prior to 2001. 11 Q If that helps you place a date, do you remember when you were with your father when he bought the computer is father when he bought the computer of yourself — A No. 12 Q Have you purchased Dell products from Dell yourself? 13 Q Have you purchased refurbished products from Dell yourself? 14 Q Have you purchased refurbished computer products? 15 Q Have you purchased refurbished computer products? 16 Q When you have done that, did you have any discussions with Dell as to 17 W. RAYMOND 2 whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers? 4 A Do I have any discussion with Dell as to 2 When you purchase the computer, you said you purchased refurbished computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 11 A Yes. 2 Q When you purchase the computer, you said you purchased refurbished computers? 4 A Do I have any discussion with Dell as to 2 When you discussion with Dell as to 2 Q When you purchase the computer, you said you purchased refurbished computers? 4 A Do I have any discussion with Dell as to 2 Q When you purchase the computer, you said you purchased refurbished computer so they sell it to you? 3 A I can't remember exactly, but I remember a phone call exactly where they mentioned that when they bring the computer back, they try to put it back so the user will have it exactly the way they were charged. 3 Q Maybe I am not understanding, When you were buying a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're talking about? 4 A I don't recall. 5 Q Men you're read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Eshibi			$\overline{}$	
2 computer. Correct me if it's wrong. 3 A It's correct. 4 Q So it's correct that you were with your father when he bought the computer? 7 A Yes. 8 Q So we know he bought the computer before August of 2001? 10 A Prior to 2001. 11 Q If that helps you place a date, do you remember when you were with your father when he bought the computer before August of 2001? 12 Q If that helps you place a date, do you remember when you were with your father when he bought the computer. 12 A No. 13 Father when he bought the computer for Dell, refurbished, I call them to ask them if I have a technical problem, and I'll speak to them. When I buy stuff refurbished, I'll tell the guy online for for the guy on gurchased fefurbished computer from pell, that for the guy online for for bell guy online for the guy online for for bell guy on guy for the for for bell guy online for for bell guy on guy for for bell guy online for for bell guy on guy for for bell guy on guy for for bell guy on guy for for bell gu		70	'	72
3 A It's correct. 4 Q So it's correct that you were 5 with your father when he bought the 6 computer? 7 A Yes. 8 Q So we know he bought the 9 computer before August of 2001? 10 A Prior to 2001. 11 Q If that helps you place a date, 12 do you remember when you were with your 13 father when he bought the computer? 14 A No. 15 Q Have you purchased Dell products 16 yourself 17 MR. GABRIEL: Withdrawn. 18 Q Have you purchased refurbished 19 products from Dell yourself? 20 MR. ALTMAN: Him personally? 21 Q Have you purchased refurbished 22 computer products? 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you have done that, did you 25 have any discussions with Dell as to 16 Q When you purchased refurbished 26 computer products of the trefurbished computers? 27 A Yes. 28 A Yes. 29 Q When you have done that, did you 29 have any discussions with Dell as to 20 When you purchased refurbished 21 computer products of the trefurbished computers? 22 A When you have done that, did you 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you have done that, did you 25 have any discussions with Dell as to 20 When you purchased refurbished 30 refurbished computers? 4 A Do I have any discussion with 5 Dell? 5 Dell? 6 Q When you purchased refurbished 6 computer from Dell year. 71 That's what you were just talking about? 72 When you get Dell to fix a computer, they 73 When you get Dell to fix a computer, they 74 That's what you were just talking about? 75 A All depends on the problem. 76 A Yes. 78 A Yes. 79 When you first bought the 79 C When you first bought the 70 C When you have done that, did you 70 When you have an understanding that they do wipe the hard drives? 71 When you were during a few problem. 71 When you were during a few problem. 72 When you have an understanding that they do wipe the hard drives? 79 A I have no information to answer the treve wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 79 A I can't remember exactly, the way they 79 MR. All thave no information to answer the trevership the drives? 79 A I dan't recall. 70 A Yes. 80 A Yes. 90 A Yes A Yes. 91 A Yes A Yes	1	W. RAYMOND	1	W. RAYMOND
4 C So it's correct that you were 5 with your father when he bought the 6 computer? 7 A Yes. 8 Q So we know he bought the 9 computer before August of 2001? 10 A Prior to 2001. 10 Yes when he bought the 12 Yes when you give before August of 2001? 11 Q If that helps you place a date, 12 do you remember when you were with your 13 father when he bought the computer? 12 A No. 9 Have you purchased Dell products 15 Yourself	2	computer. Correct me if it's wrong.	2	A I'll say it different. When I
technical problem, and I'll speak to them. When I buy stuff refurbished, I'll tell the guy online A Yes. Q So we know he bought the computer before August of 2001? A Prior to 2001. Q If that helps you place a date, and you remember when you were with your father when he bought the computer? A No. Q Have you purchased Dell products yourself Y	3	A It's correct.	3	purchased computer from Dell, refurbished,
6 computer? 7 A Yes. 8 Q So we know he bought the computer before August of 2001? 10 A Prior to 2001. 11 Q If that helps you place a date, a fater when he bought the computer? 12 do you remember when you were with your a father when he bought the computer? 13 father when he bought the computer? 14 A No. 15 Q Have you purchased Dell products products from Dell yourself? 16 Q Have you purchased refurbished products from Dell yourself? 17 Q Have you purchased refurbished computer products? 18 Q Have you purchased refurbished computer products? 20 A Yes. 21 Q When you have done that, did you have any discussions with Dell as to 22 A Yes. 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you purchased refurbished whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 11 A Yes. 12 Q What did they tell you? 13 A I can't remember exactly, but I remember a phone call exactly where they mentioned that when they bring the computer back, they try to put it back so the user will have it exactly the way they were charged. 20 When you were buying a refurbished computer products? 31 A Yes. 32 A Yes. 33 A Yes. 44 A Do I have any discussion with Dell as to 34 A Sonetimes they send a technican over. 35 A I depends on the problem. 36 A All depends on the problem. 36 A All depends on the problem. 36 A Yes. 30 When you purchased refurbished computer pust buying it, did you have any discussions with Dell as to 35 A Yes. 36 Q When you purchased refurbished whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers? 37 A Yes. 38 Q What yie	4	Q So it's correct that you were	4	I call them to ask them if I have a
the guy online — Q So we know he bought the computer before August of 2001? A Prior to 2001. It of that helps you place a date, do you remember when you were with your father when he bought the computer? A No. A No. A Have you purchased Dell products of MR. GABRIEL: Withdrawn. B Have you purchased refurbished products from Dell yourself? A Ne. A Have you purchased refurbished products from Dell yourself? A R. ALTMAN: Him personally? A Yes. A When you've done that, at that time when you're just buying it, did you have any discussions with Dell as to W. RAYMOND Whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers? A Do I have any discussion with Dell? A Yes. Q When you purchased refurbished refurbished computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? A Yes. Q When you purchased refurbished computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? A Yes. Q When you purchased refurbished computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? A Yes. Q What did they tell you? A Yes. Q What did they tell you? A Yes. Q What you purchased refurbished computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? A Yes. Q What you get Dell to fix a computer, they through it before? A A Idepends on the problem. Sometimes they send a technician over. A All depends on the problem. Sometimes they send a technician over. A Wes. Q When you've done that the time when you're just buying it, did you have any discussions with Dell about when they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers? A I No. Q Mr. RAYMOND When you get Dell to fix a computer refurbished, to you get be fore and the woll when you've done that, at that time when you're just buying it, did you have any discussions with Dell ab	5	with your father when he bought the	5	technical problem, and I'll speak to them.
8 Q So we know he bought the computer before August of 2001? 10 A Prior to 2001. 11 Q If that helps you place a date, do you remember when you were with your father when he bought the computer? 12 do you remember when you were with your father when he bought the computer? 13 A No. 14 A No. 15 Q Have you purchased Dell products yourself — MR. GABRIEL: Withdrawn. 18 Q Have you purchased refurbished products from Dell yourself? 19 Products from Dell yourself? 20 Q When you purchased refurbished computer products? 21 Q Have you purchased refurbished computer products? 22 A Yes. 24 Q When you have done that, did you have any discussions with Dell as to 25 A No. 26 Q When you purchased the computer, you said you purchased the computer, you said you purchased the computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 11 A Yes. 12 Q When you purchase the computer, you said you purchase the computer, you said you purchase the computer, you said you purchased refurbished computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 15 Q When you burchased refurbished computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 16 Q When you purchased refurbished computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before to they sell it to you? 16 Q When you burchased refurbished computer and they will have they tried they sell a refurbished computer? 17 A Yes. 18 A Yes. 19 Q When you burchased that they on the they you before, and your counsel may object to the exhibit, but have you seen the letter before today? 16 Q Maybe I am not understanding, When you were buying a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're talking about? 18 A I don't recall. 19 Q Maybe I am not understanding, When you were buying a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're talking about? 20 When you've done that time wheney you'pe labout whether they wiped the hard drives on the time when yo	6	computer?	6	When I buy stuff refurbished, I'll tell
9 computer before August of 2001? 10 A Prior to 2001. 11 Q If that helps you place a date, do you remember when you were with your father when he bought the computer? 13 father when he bought the computer? 14 A No. 15 Q Have you purchased Dell products 16 yourself 17 MR. GABRIEL: Withdrawn. 18 Q Have you purchased refurbished 19 products from Dell yourself? 20 MR. ALTMAN: Him personally? 21 Q Have you purchased refurbished 22 computer products? 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you have done that, did you have any discussions with Dell about whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers? 24 A Do I have any discussion with 5 Dell? 2 When you purchased refurbished 6 computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 2 A Yes. 2 What did they tell you? 3 A I can't remember exactly, but I remember a phone call exactly where they they sell it to you? 4 A Yes. 2 What did they tell you? 5 A I can't remember exactly, the user will have it exactly the way they were charged. 6 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 7 When you say "put it back," I am What you were just talking about? 7 When you get Dell to fix a computer, to get it to you if the same state you gave it A All depends to two jou in the same state you gave it A All depends to two jour the technician over. A All depends to two jour in the same state you gave it A All depends on the problem. Sometimes they send a technician over. A Wen you've done that before? A Yes. Q When you're just buying it, did you have any discussions with Dell about whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers? 1 W. RAYMOND 1 Whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers. 1 W. RAYMOND 2 When you purchased refurbished somputers? 3 A I have no information to answer that they do wipe the hard drives before today? 4 A Do I have any discussion with them whether in the problem in the problem. 5 Q Mr. Raymond, if I can ask you, look a	7	A Yes.	1	the guy online
10	8	Q So we know he bought the	8	
11	9	computer before August of 2001?	9	
do you remember when you were with your father when he bought the computer? 14 A No. 15 Q Have you purchased Dell products yourself 16 W. RAYMOND 17 Whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers? 18 A Do I have any discussion with Dell? 19 When you purchased refurbished 22 whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 10 When you have done that, did you 25 whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers? 10 When you purchased refurbished 25 whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 11 W. RAYMOND 12 When you purchased refurbished 26 whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 13 A I can't remember exactly, but I remember a phone call exactly where they were charged. 14 A Yes. 15 Q Have you purchased refurbished 27 whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 16 Q When you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 16 A Yes. 17 W. RAYMOND 18 Q Have you purchased refurbished 27 whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 19 A Yes. 10 When you discuss with them 28 whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 10 A I can't remember exactly, but I remember a phone call exactly where they mentioned that when they bring the 28 were charged. 19 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 10 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 11 Q I know you've read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? 20 When you say "put it back," I am 24 I don't recall. 21 A Yes. 22 Q When you've read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? 21 A I don't recall. 22 A I don't recall. 23 A I know you've read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today. Exhibit 17?	ш	A Prior to 2001.	10	When you get Dell to fix a computer, they
13 father when he bought the computer? 14 A No. 15 Q Have you purchased Dell products 16 yourself 17 MR. GABRIEL: Withdrawn. 18 Q Have you purchased refurbished 19 products from Dell yourself? 20 MR. ALTMAN: Him personally? 21 Q Have you purchased refurbished 22 computer products? 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you have done that, did you have any discussions with Dell about whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers? 4 A Do I have any discussion with 5 Dell? 6 Q When you purchased refurbished computers. 7 you said you purchased refurbished computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 1 A Yes. 1 Q When you purchase the computer, you said you purchase the computer they sell it to you? 1 A Yes. 1 Q When you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 1 A Yes. 1 Q When you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 1 A Yes. 1 Q What did they tell you? 2 Q What did they tell you? 3 A I can't remember a phone call exactly where they mentioned that when they bring the computer back, they try to put it back so the user will have it exactly the way they were charged. 2 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 3 A A All depends on the problem. 16 C Q When you purchased refurbished computers from Dell, that's what you're 2 talking about? 2 A Yes. 3 A A Yes. 4 A Do I have any discussion with Dell about whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computer beach, they try to put it back so the user will have it exactly the way they were charged. 4 A Do I have any discussion with Dell as to 2 When you were buying a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're 2 talking about? 3 A Yes. 4 A Do I have any discussion with Dell about whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished whether they wiped the hard drives b	41	Q If that helps you place a date,		try to get it back to you in the same
14 A No. 15 Q Have you purchased Dell products 16 yourself 17 MR. GABRIEL: Withdrawn. 18 Q Have you purchased refurbished 19 products from Dell yourself? 20 MR. ALTMAN: Him personally? 21 Q Have you purchased refurbished 22 computer products? 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you have done that, did you have any discussions with Dell about whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers? 4 A Do I have any discussion with 5 Dell? 5 Dell? 6 Q When you purchase the computer, you said you purchased refurbished computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 11 A Yes. 12 Q What did they tell you? 13 A I can't remember exactly, but I remember a phone call exactly where they mentioned that when they bring the computer back, they try to put it back so the user will have it exactly the way they were charged. 19 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 19 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 20 When you say "put it back," I am 21 La Yes. 22 S A No. 23 A No. 24 Q Do you have an understanding that they do wipe the hard drives before that question. 25 La Yes. 26 Q When you purchase the computer, you said you purchased refurbished to the verification of the v		do you remember when you were with your		
1.5 Q Have you purchased Dell products yourself 1.7 MR. GABRIEL: Withdrawn. 1.8 Q Have you purchased refurbished products from Dell yourself? 2.0 MR. ALTMAN: Him personally? 2.1 Q Have you purchased refurbished computer products? 2.2 A Yes. 2.3 A Yes. 2.4 Q When you have done that, did you have any discussions with Dell about whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers? 4 A Do I have any discussion with 5 Dell? 6 Q When you purchased refurbished computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before to they sell it to you? 1.1 A Yes. 2.2 Q When you purchased refurbished computer by a lit to you? 2.3 A I can't remember exactly, but I remember a phone call exactly where they mentioned that when they bring the computer back, they try to put it back so the user will have it exactly the way they were charged. 2. When you said you purchased refurbished computer back, they try to put it back so the user will have it exactly the way they were charged. 3 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 4 A Yes. 4 Q When you wifer they wiped the hard drives before to the exhibit, but have you seen the letter before to the exhibit, but have you seen the letter before to the exhibit, but have you seen the letter before to the exhibit, but have you seen the letter before. 4 A I can't remember exactly, but I remember a phone call exactly where they mentioned that when they bring the computer back, they try to put it back so the user will have it exactly the way they were charged. 4 A Yes. 5 Q I know you've read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? 6 A I don't recall. 7 Q I know you've read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? 8 A Yes. 9 A Yes. 9 A Yes. 1 A Yes. 1 A Yes. 1 A Yes. 1 A Yes. 2 A No. 2 When you discussions with them whether they wiped the hard drives on the are furbished or put in the computer from Dell, that's what you'	II .	father when he bought the computer?	•	
16 yourself	"	•	1	
17 MR. GABRIEL: Withdrawn. 18 Q Have you purchased refurbished 19 products from Dell yourself? 20 MR. ALTMAN: Him personally? 21 Q Have you purchased refurbished 22 computer products? 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you have done that, did you 25 have any discussions with Dell as to 71 1 W. RAYMOND 2 whether they wiped the hard drives on the 3 refurbished computers? 4 A Do I have any discussion with 5 Dell? 6 Q When you purchase the computer, 7 you said you purchase the computer, 9 whether they wiped the hard drives before 10 they sell it to you? 11 A Yes. 12 Q What did they tell you? 13 A I can't remember a phone call exactly where they mentioned that when they bring the 16 computer back, they try to put it back so 17 the user will have it exactly the way they 18 were charged. 19 When you verdeased refurbished 20 Uno you have an understanding that they do wipe the hard drives before they sell a refurbished computer? 3 A I have no information to answer 4 A Do I have any discussion with 5 Dell? 6 Q When you purchase the computer, 9 you said you purchased refurbished 10 they sell it to you? 11 A Yes. 12 Q What did they tell you? 13 A I can't remember a phone call exactly where they mentioned that when they bring the computer back, they try to put it back so 17 the user will have it exactly the way they 18 were charged. 19 When you were buying a refurbished 20 When you were buying a refurbished 21 computer from Dell, that's what you're 22 talking about? 24 Q When you sall you purchase the computer, 25 A No. 26 Q Do you have an understanding the a refurbished computer? 27 A I have no information to answer that question. 28 A I have no information to answer that question. 29 Mr. Raymond, if I can ask you, look at Exhibit 17, the letter to wo use of the exhibit, but have you seen the letter to see it before today? 29 A I don't recall. 20 You've read through it onw. 21 I don't recall. 22 You've read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? 29 You've	N			
18 Q Have you purchased refurbished products from Dell yourself? 20 MR. ALTMAN: Him personally? 21 Q Have you purchased refurbished computer products? 22 A Yes. 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you have done that, did you have any discussions with Dell about whether they wiped the hard drives? 25 A Yes. 26 When you have done that, did you have any discussions with Dell as to 27 Dell? 28 When you have done that, did you have any discussions with Dell as to 29 The weether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers? 30 A Do you have an understanding that they do wipe the hard drive before 31 The weether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers? 4 A Do I have any discussion with Dell as to 4 Dell? 5 Dell? 6 Q When you purchase the computer, you said you purchased refurbished computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 4 A Yes. 6 Q Whan you purchased refurbished to whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 5 A Yes. 6 Q Whan you were busing a refurbished computer back, they try to put it back so the user will have it exactly the way they were charged. 6 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 7 You were busing a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're talking about? 8 When you were busing a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're talking about? 9 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 9 When you were busing a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're talking about? 9 Q When you were busing a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're talking about? 9 Q When you were busing a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're talking about? 9 Q When you were busing a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're talking about? 9 Q When you were busing a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're talking about? 9 Q When you were busing a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're talking about? 9 Q When you were busing a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're talking about		•		
19 products from Deli yourself? 20 MR. ALTMAN: Him personally? 21 Q Have you purchased refurbished 22 computer products? 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you have done that, did you 25 have any discussions with Dell as to 71 1 W. RAYMOND 2 whether they wiped the hard drives on the 3 refurbished computers? 4 A Do I have any discussion with 5 Dell? 6 Q When you purchase the computer, 7 you said you purchased refurbished 8 computers. Did you discuss with them 9 whether they wiped the hard drives before 10 they sell it to you? 11 A Yes. 12 Q What did they tell you? 13 A I can't remember exactly, but I remember a phone call exactly where they mentioned that when they bring the computer back, they try to put it back so the user will have it exactly the way they were charged. 20 When you say "put it back," I am 19 Q When you're just buying it, did you there when you're just buying it, did you whether they wiped the hard drives? 21 A Yes. 22 A Yes. 23 A No. 24 Q Do you have an understanding that they do wipe the hard drive before 25 that they do wipe the hard drive before 26 They sell a refurbished computer? 27 A I have no information to answer that question. 28 A I have no information to answer that question. 29 Q Mr. Raymond, if I can ask you, look at Exhibit 17, the letter to the exhibit, but have you seen the letter to the exhibit, but have you seen the letter before today? 28 A I don't recall. 29 Q When you've read it or seen it before. 29 A I don't recall. 20 Q You've read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? 20 A Yes. 21 A Yes. 22 Q When you say "put it back," I am 25 A Yes. 26 Q When you say "put it back," I am 26 A I don't recall. 27 A Yes. 28 A Yes. 29 When you say "put it back," I am 29 G When you've read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? 29 A I don't recall.	11		1	
20 MR. ALTMAN: Him personally? 21 Q Have you purchased refurbished computer products? 22 computer products? 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you have done that, did you have any discussions with Dell about whether they wiped the hard drives? 25 have any discussions with Dell as to 71 1 W. RAYMOND 2 whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers? 3 refurbished computers? 4 A Do I have any discussion with 5 Dell? 6 Q When you purchase the computer, you said you purchased refurbished computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 11 A Yes. 12 Q What did they tell you? 13 A I can't remember exactly, but I remember a phone call exactly where they mentioned that when they bring the computer back, they try to put it back so the user will have it exactly the way they were charged. 10 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 11 W. RAYMOND 12 they sell a refurbished computer? 13 A I have no information to answer that question. 15 Q Mr. Raymond, if I can ask you, look at Exhibit 17, the letter to you before, and your counsel may object to the exhibit, but have you seen the letter before today? 11 A Yes. 12 Q What did they tell you? 13 A I can't remember exactly, but I remember a phone call exactly where they mentioned that when they bring the computer back, they try to put it back so the user will have it exactly the way they were charged. 10 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 11 W. RAYMOND 12 they sell a refurbished computer? 13 A I have no information to answer that question. 15 Q Mr. Raymond, if I can ask you, look at Exhibit 17, the letter to you before, and your counsel may object to the exhibit, but have you seen the letter before today? 13 A I don't recall. 14 Q Take a minute to read through it or seen it before. 15 A I don't recall. 16 Q You've read through it? 17 Q You've read through it? 18 A I'm reading through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? 24 A I don't recall.			1	
21 Q Have you purchased refurbished computer products? 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you have done that, did you have any discussions with Dell as to 25 have any discussions with Dell as to 26 Q When you have done that, did you have any discussions with Dell as to 27 Q Do you have an understanding that they do wipe the hard drive before 28 A No. 29 Q Do you have an understanding that they do wipe the hard drive before 29 Take sell a refurbished computer? 30 A I have no information to answer that question. 40 A Do I have any discussion with 50 Dell? 60 Q When you purchase the computer, you said you purchased refurbished computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 20 Mren you purchased refurbished they tell you? 21 A Yes. 22 Q What did they tell you? 23 A No. 24 Q Do you have an understanding that they do wipe the hard drive before 25 that they do wipe the hard drive before 26 A I have any discussions with Dell about whether they wiped the hard drives? 27 A No. 28 A No. 29 Do you have an understanding that they do wipe the hard drive before 20 Ar No. 21 W. RAYMOND 22 they sell a refurbished computer? 3 A I have any discussions with Dell about whether they wipe the hard drive before 29 They sell a refurbished computer? 3 A I have any discussions with Dell about whether they wipe the hard drive before 4 A Do I have any discussions with Dell about whether they wipe the hard drive before 4 A Do I have any discussions with Dell about whether they wipe the hard drive before 5 A I have any discussions with Dell about whether they wipe the hard drive before 6 Q Mr. Raymond, if I can ask you, 6 look at Exhibit 17, the letter to 7 Mr. Altman. I think when I showed it to 8 you before, and your consel may object to the exhibit, but have you seen the letter before today? 11 A I don't recall. 12 Q Take a minute to read through it a little bit to see if it jogs your recollection as to whether you've read it or seen it before today, Exhibit 17? 18 A I'm reading through it right			1	• '
22 computer products? 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you have done that, did you have any discussions with Dell as to 25 have any discussions with Dell as to 26			1	
23 A Yes. 24 Q When you have done that, did you have any discussions with Dell as to 71 W. RAYMOND Whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers? A Do I have any discussion with Dell? Q When you purchase the computer, you said you purchased refurbished computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? A Yes. Q What did they tell you? A I can't remember exactly, but I remember a phone call exactly where they mentioned that when they bring the computer back, they try to put it back so the user will have it exactly the way they were charged. Q Maybe I am not understanding. When you were buying a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're talking about? A Yes. Q When you say "put it back," I am A I can't recall. A I can't recall. A I don't recall.			1	
24 Q When you have done that, did you have any discussions with Dell as to 71 1 W. RAYMOND 2 whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers? 4 A Do I have any discussion with 5 Dell? 5 Q When you purchase the computer, you said you purchased refurbished computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 11 A Yes. 12 Q What did they tell you? 13 A I can't remember exactly, but I remember a phone call exactly where they mentioned that when they bring the computer back, they try to put it back so the user will have it exactly the way they were charged. 12 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 20 When you were buying a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're talking about? 24 Q Do you have an understanding 15 that they do wipe the hard drive before that they do wipe the hard drive before 12 they sell a refurbished computer? 3 A I have no information to answer that question. 4 A Do I have any discuss with them 4 that question. 5 Q Mr. Raymond, if I can ask you, 6 look at Exhibit 17, the letter to 7 Mr. Altman. I think when I showed it to 8 you before, and your counsel may object to 9 the exhibit, but have you seen the letter before today? 11 A I can't remember exactly, but I 2 Q Take a minute to read through it 2 a little bit to see if it jogs your recollection as to whether you've read it or seen it before. 16 A I don't recall. 17 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 18 A I'm reading through it right now. 20 Q I know you've read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? 21 A I don't recall.				• •
that they do wipe the hard drive before 71 W. RAYMOND whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers? A Do I have any discussion with Dell? When you purchased refurbished to whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? A Yes. Q What did they tell you? A I can't remember a phone call exactly where they mentioned that when they bring the computer back, they try to put it back so the user will have it exactly the way they when you were buying a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're talking about? A Yes. Q When you said you purchased the computer, you said you purchased refurbished they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? A Yes. A I don't recall. Q Take a minute to read through it a little bit to see if it jogs your recollection as to whether you've read it or seen it before. A I don't recall. Q You've read through it? A I'm reading through it right now. Q I know you've read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? A Yes. Q When you say "put it back," I am A I don't recall. A I'm reading through it? A I'm re				
1 W. RAYMOND 2 whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers? 3 A Do I have any discussion with Dell? 4 A Do I have any discussion with Dell? 5 Q When you purchase the computer, you said you purchased refurbished computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? 11 A Yes. 12 Q What did they tell you? 13 A I can't remember exactly, but I remember a phone call exactly where they mentioned that when they bring the computer back, they try to put it back so the user will have it exactly the way they were charged. 19 Q Maybe I am not understanding, When you were buying a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're talking about? 2 A Yes. 2 Q When you say "put it back," I am 7 W. RAYMOND 2 they sell a refurbished computer? 3 A I have no information to answer that question. 5 Q Mr. Raymond, if I can ask you, look at Exhibit 17, the letter to 7 Mr. Altman. I think when I showed it to 80 you before, and your counsel may object to 80 the exhibit, but have you seen the letter 9 before today? 10 A I don't recall. 11 Q Take a minute to read through it a little bit to see if it jogs your recollection as to whether you've read it or seen it before. 14 A I don't recall. 15 Q You've read through it? 16 Q When you were buying a refurbished 20 Q I know you've read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? 24 A I don't recall.			1	
1 W. RAYMOND 2 whether they wiped the hard drives on the 3 refurbished computers? 4 A Do I have any discussion with 5 Dell? 6 Q When you purchase the computer, 7 you said you purchased refurbished 8 computers. Did you discuss with them 9 whether they wiped the hard drives before 10 they sell it to you? 11 A Yes. 12 Q What did they tell you? 13 A I can't remember exactly, but I 14 remember a phone call exactly where they mentioned that when they bring the computer back, they try to put it back so 17 the user will have it exactly the way they 18 were charged. 19 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 10 W. RAYMOND 2 they sell a refurbished computer? 3 A I have no information to answer that question. 5 Q Mr. Raymond, if I can ask you, 6 look at Exhibit 17, the letter to 7 Mr. Altman. I think when I showed it to 8 you before, and your counsel may object to 9 the exhibit, but have you seen the letter before today? 11 A I don't recall. 12 Q Take a minute to read through it a little bit to see if it jogs your recollection as to whether you've read it or seen it before. 10 A I don't recall. 11 W. RAYMOND 2 they sell a refurbished computer? 3 A I have no information to answer that question. 5 Q Mr. Raymond, if I can ask you, 6 look at Exhibit 17, the letter to 7 Mr. Altman. I think when I showed it to 8 you before, and your counsel may object to 9 the exhibit, but have you seen the letter 10 they sell it to you? 11 A I don't recall. 12 Q Take a minute to read through it or seen it before. 13 A I don't recall. 14 Q You've read through it? 15 now. 16 Look at Exhibit 17, the letter to 7 Mr. Altman. I think when I showed it to you before, and your counsel may object to the exhibit, but have you seen the letter before. 14 I don't recall. 15 Q You've read through it? 16 Q You've read through it? 17 Q You've read through it? 18 A I don't recall. 29 You've read through it? 20 Q I know you've read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? 20 A I don't recall.	<u>k</u> 3	nave any discussions with Dell as to	25	
whether they wiped the hard drives on the refurbished computers? A Do I have any discussion with Dell? Q When you purchase the computer, you said you purchased refurbished computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? A Yes. Q What did they tell you? A I can't remember exactly, but I remember a phone call exactly where they mentioned that when they bring the computer back, they try to put it back so the user will have it exactly the way they were charged. Q Maybe I am not understanding. When you were buying a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're talking about? A Yes. Q When you say "put it back," I am 2 they sell a refurbished computer? A I have no information to answer that question. Q Mr. Raymond, if I can ask you, look at Exhibit 17, the letter to Mr. Altman. I think when I showed it to you before, and your counsel may object to the exhibit, but have you seen the letter before today? A I don't recall. Q Take a minute to read through it recollection as to whether you've read it or seen it before. A I don't recall. Q You've read through it? A I'm reading through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? A I don't recall. Q You've read through it? I have no information to answer that question. Mr. Altman. I think when I showed it to you before, and your counsel may object to the exhibit, but have you seen the letter before today? A I don't recall. Q You've read through it? A I'm reading through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? A I don't recall. A I don't recall. Q You've read through it? A I'm reading through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17?		71		73
a refurbished computers? A Do I have any discussion with Dell? Q When you purchase the computer, you said you purchased refurbished computers. Did you discuss with them whether they wiped the hard drives before they sell it to you? A Yes. Q What did they tell you? A I can't remember exactly, but I remember a phone call exactly where they mentioned that when they bring the computer back, they try to put it back so the user will have it exactly the way they were charged. Q Maybe I am not understanding. When you were buying a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're talking about? A Yes. Q When you say "put it back," I am A I have no information to answer that question. A I donk at Exhibit 17, the letter to Mr. Altman. I think when I showed it to you before, and your counsel may object to the exhibit, but have you seen the letter before today? A I don't recall.	ll		1	
4 A Do I have any discussion with 5 Dell? 6 Q When you purchase the computer, 7 you said you purchased refurbished 8 computers. Did you discuss with them 9 whether they wiped the hard drives before 10 they sell it to you? 11 A Yes. 12 Q What did they tell you? 13 A I can't remember exactly, but I 14 remember a phone call exactly where they 15 mentioned that when they bring the 16 computer back, they try to put it back so 17 the user will have it exactly the way they 18 were charged. 19 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 19 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 20 When you were buying a refurbished 21 computer from Dell, that's what you're 22 talking about? 24 Q When you say "put it back," I am 4 that question. 5 Q Mr. Raymond, if I can ask you, 6 look at Exhibit 17, the letter to 7 Mr. Altman. I think when I showed it to 8 you before, and your counsel may object to 9 the exhibit, but have you seen the letter 10 before today? 11 A I don't recall. 12 Q Take a minute to read through it 13 a little bit to see if it jogs your 14 recollection as to whether you've read it 15 or seen it before. 16 A I don't recall. 17 Q You've read through it? 18 A I'm reading through it right 19 now. 20 U I know you've read through it 21 retaitively quickly, but does it jog your 22 recollection as to whether you've seen it 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you say "put it back," I am 4 that question. 5 Q Mr. Raymond, if I can ask you, 6 look at Exhibit 17, the letter to 7 Mr. Altman. I think when I showed it to 9 you before, and your counsel may object to 9 the exhibit, but have you seen the letter 10 to any underent or counsel may object to 10 before today? 11 A I don't recall. 12 Q Take a minute to read through it 13 a little bit to see if it jogs your 14 recollection as to whether you've read it or seen it before. 15 Q You've read through it? 16 A I don't recall. 17 Q You've read through it? 18 A I'm reading through it? 19 Q I know you've read through it? 20 Lake Take A I don't recall. 21 computer or call through it? 22 talking about? 23 A Yes. 24 D A				
5 Dell? 6 Q When you purchase the computer, 7 you said you purchased refurbished 8 computers. Did you discuss with them 9 whether they wiped the hard drives before 10 they sell it to you? 11 A Yes. 12 Q What did they tell you? 13 A I can't remember exactly, but I 14 remember a phone call exactly where they 15 mentioned that when they bring the 16 computer back, they try to put it back so 17 the user will have it exactly the way they 18 were charged. 19 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 20 When you were buying a refurbished 21 computer from Dell, that's what you're 22 talking about? 24 Q When you say "put it back," I am 5 Q Mr. Raymond, if I can ask you, 6 look at Exhibit 17, the letter to 7 Mr. Altman. I think when I showed it to 8 you before, and your counsel may object to 9 the exhibit, but have you seen the letter before today? 11 A I don't recall. 12 Q Take a minute to read through it a little bit to see if it jogs your recollection as to whether you've read it or seen it before. 16 A I don't recall. 17 Q You've read through it? 18 A I'm reading through it right now. 20 U I know you've read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? 21 Exhibit 17, the letter to 22 Mr. Raymond, if I can ask you, 23 A Yes. 24 When you purchased refurbished something to the exhibit, but have you seen the letter before today? 25 A I don't recall. 26 A I don't recall. 27 A I don't recall. 28 A I'm reading through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? 28 A I don't recall. 29 A I don't recall. 20 A I don't recall. 30 A I'm reading through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? 31 A I don't recall. 40 A I don't recall. 41 A I'm reading through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today.		•	1	
6 Q When you purchase the computer, 7 you said you purchased refurbished 8 computers. Did you discuss with them 9 whether they wiped the hard drives before 10 they sell it to you? 11 A Yes. 12 Q What did they tell you? 13 A I can't remember exactly, but I 14 remember a phone call exactly where they 15 mentioned that when they bring the 16 computer back, they try to put it back so 17 the user will have it exactly the way they 18 were charged. 19 Iook at Exhibit 17, the letter to 7 Mr. Altman. I think when I showed it to 8 you before, and your counsel may object to 9 the exhibit, but have you seen the letter 10 the axibit, but have you seen the letter 11 before today? 12 A I don't recall. 13 a little bit to see if it jogs your 14 recollection as to whether you've read it or seen it before. 16 A I don't recall. 17 Q You've read through it? 18 A I'm reading through it right 19 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 20 When you were buying a refurbished 21 computer from Dell, that's what you're 22 talking about? 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you say "put it back," I am 26 Iook at Exhibit 17, the letter to 7 Mr. Altman. I think when I showed it to 8 you before, and your counsel may object to 9 the exhibit, but have you seen the letter 10 the exhibit, but have you seen the letter 11 a little bit to see if it jogs your 12 recollection as to whether you've read it or seen it before. 14 A I don't recall. 15 A I don't recall. 16 Q You've read through it? 18 A I'm reading through it right now. 29 Q I know you've read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? 20 When you say "put it back," I am 21 A I don't recall. 22 A I don't recall. 23 A Yes. 24 A I don't recall. 26 A I don't recall. 27 A I don't recall. 28 A I don't recall. 29 A I don't recall. 30 A I don't recall. 40 A I don't recall. 41 A I don't recall. 41 A I don't recall. 41 A I don't recall. 42 A I don't recall. 43 A I don't recall. 44 A I don't recall. 45 A I don't recall. 46 A I don't recall. 47 A I do				
7 you said you purchased refurbished 8 computers. Did you discuss with them 9 whether they wiped the hard drives before 10 they sell it to you? 11 A Yes. 11 A I don't recall. 12 Q What did they tell you? 13 A I can't remember exactly, but I 13 a little bit to see if it jogs your recollection as to whether you've read it 15 mentioned that when they bring the 15 mentioned that when they bring the 16 computer back, they try to put it back so 16 the user will have it exactly the way they 17 were charged. 18 A I'm reading through it right 19 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 19 When you were buying a refurbished 20 Q I know you've read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today? 18 A Yes. 24 When you say "put it back," I am 24 A I don't recall.			1	
8 computers. Did you discuss with them 9 whether they wiped the hard drives before 10 they sell it to you? 11 A Yes. 12 Q What did they tell you? 13 A I can't remember exactly, but I 14 remember a phone call exactly where they 15 mentioned that when they bring the 16 computer back, they try to put it back so 17 the user will have it exactly the way they 18 were charged. 19 you before, and your counsel may object to 19 the exhibit, but have you seen the letter 10 before today? 11 A I don't recall. 12 Q Take a minute to read through it 13 a little bit to see if it jogs your 14 recollection as to whether you've read it 15 or seen it before. 16 A I don't recall. 17 Q You've read through it? 18 A I'm reading through it right 19 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 19 Q I know you've read through it 19 relatively quickly, but does it jog your 19 recollection as to whether you've seen it 20 D I know you've read through it 21 relatively quickly, but does it jog your 22 recollection as to whether you've seen it 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you say "put it back," I am 25 A I don't recall. 26 A I don't recall. 27 A I don't recall. 28 A I don't recall. 29 You've read through it 20 R I know you've read through it 21 relatively quickly, but does it jog your 22 recollection as to whether you've seen it 23 A Yes. 24 A Yes. 25 A I don't recall. 26 A I don't recall. 27 A I don't recall. 28 A I don't recall. 29 A I don't recall. 20 A I don't recall. 20 A I don't recall. 21 A I don't recall. 22 A I don't recall. 23 A Yes. 24 A Yes.			i	•
9 whether they wiped the hard drives before 10 they sell it to you? 11 A Yes. 12 Q What did they tell you? 13 A I can't remember exactly, but I 14 remember a phone call exactly where they 15 mentioned that when they bring the 16 computer back, they try to put it back so 17 the user will have it exactly the way they 18 were charged. 19 the exhibit, but have you seen the letter 10 before today? 11 A I don't recall. 12 Q Take a minute to read through it 13 a little bit to see if it jogs your 14 recollection as to whether you've read it 15 or seen it before. 16 A I don't recall. 17 Q You've read through it? 18 A I'm reading through it right 19 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 19 Nhen you were buying a refurbished 20 When you were buying a refurbished 21 computer from Dell, that's what you're 22 talking about? 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you say "put it back," I am 25 the exhibit, but have you seen the letter 26 before today? 27 A I don't recall. 28 A I'm reading through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your 29 recollection as to whether you've seen it 20 before today, Exhibit 17? 21 A I don't recall. 22 A I don't recall. 23 A I don't recall. 24 A I don't recall. 26 A I don't recall. 27 A I don't recall. 28 A I don't recall. 29 A I don't recall. 20 A I don't recall. 20 A I don't recall. 21 A I don't recall. 22 A I don't recall. 23 A I don't recall. 24 A I don't recall. 25 A I don't recall. 26 A I don't recall. 27 A I don't recall. 28 A I don't recall. 29 A I don't recall. 20 A I don't recall. 20 A I don't recall. 21 A I don't recall. 22 A I don't recall. 23 A I don't recall.			1	
they sell it to you? 1			1	
11 A Yes. 12 Q What did they tell you? 13 A I can't remember exactly, but I 14 remember a phone call exactly where they 15 mentioned that when they bring the 16 computer back, they try to put it back so 17 the user will have it exactly the way they 18 were charged. 19 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 19 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 20 When you were buying a refurbished 21 computer from Dell, that's what you're 22 talking about? 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you say "put it back," I am 11 A I don't recall. 12 Q Take a minute to read through it 13 a little bit to see if it jogs your recollection as to whether you've read it 20 You've read through it right 21 now. 22 I know you've read through it 23 relatively quickly, but does it jog your 24 recollection as to whether you've seen it 25 before today, Exhibit 17? 26 A I don't recall. 27 A I don't recall. 28 A I don't recall. 29 A I don't recall. 20 A I don't recall. 20 A I don't recall. 21 A I don't recall. 22 A I don't recall. 23 A I don't recall. 24 A I don't recall. 26 A I don't recall. 27 A I don't recall. 28 A I don't recall. 29 A I don't recall. 20 A I don't recall. 20 A I don't recall. 21 A I don't recall. 22 A I don't recall. 23 A I don't recall. 24 A I don't recall. 26 A I don't recall. 27 A I don't recall. 28 A I don't recall. 29 A I don't recall. 20 A I don't recall. 20 A I don't recall. 20 A I don't recall. 21 A I don't recall. 22 A I don't recall. 23 A I don't recall. 24 A I don't recall.			1	
12 Q What did they tell you? 13 A I can't remember exactly, but I 14 remember a phone call exactly where they 15 mentioned that when they bring the 16 computer back, they try to put it back so 17 the user will have it exactly the way they 18 were charged. 19 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 19 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 20 When you were buying a refurbished 21 computer from Dell, that's what you're 22 talking about? 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you say "put it back," I am 12 Q Take a minute to read through it 13 a little bit to see if it jogs your recollection as to whether you've read it 21 or seen it before. 21 A I don't recall. 22 Q Take a minute to read through it 23 a little bit to see if it jogs your recollection as to whether you've read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it 22 before today, Exhibit 17? 24 A I don't recall.				
13 A I can't remember exactly, but I 14 remember a phone call exactly where they 15 mentioned that when they bring the 16 computer back, they try to put it back so 17 the user will have it exactly the way they 18 were charged. 19 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 19 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 20 When you were buying a refurbished 21 computer from Dell, that's what you're 22 talking about? 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you say "put it back," I am 13 a little bit to see if it jogs your recollection as to whether you've read it or seen it before. 16 A I don't recall. 17 Q You've read through it? 18 A I'm reading through it right now. 20 Q I know you've read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? 24 A I don't recall.	12			
remember a phone call exactly where they mentioned that when they bring the computer back, they try to put it back so the user will have it exactly the way they were charged. Q Maybe I am not understanding. When you were buying a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're talking about? A Yes. Q When you say "put it back," I am recollection as to whether you've read it or seen it before. A I don't recall. You've read through it? A I'm reading through it right now. Q I know you've read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? A I don't recall.	13			
mentioned that when they bring the computer back, they try to put it back so the user will have it exactly the way they were charged. Maybe I am not understanding. Maybe I am not understanding. Men you were buying a refurbished computer from Dell, that's what you're talking about? A Yes. When you say "put it back," I am 15 or seen it before. A I don't recall. 17 Q You've read through it? A I'm reading through it right now. Q I know you've read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? A I don't recall.			1	
16 computer back, they try to put it back so 17 the user will have it exactly the way they 18 were charged. 19 Q Maybe I am not understanding. 20 When you were buying a refurbished 21 computer from Dell, that's what you're 22 talking about? 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you say "put it back," I am 26 A I don't recall. 27 Q You've read through it right 28 A I'm reading through it right 29 Now. 20 Q I know you've read through it relatively quickly, but does it jog your recollection as to whether you've seen it before today, Exhibit 17? 24 A I don't recall.		•	i	
21 computer from Dell, that's what you're 22 talking about? 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you say "put it back," I am 25 recollection as to whether you've seen it 26 a J don't recall. 27 relatively quickly, but does it jog your 28 recollection as to whether you've seen it 29 a J don't recall.				
21 computer from Dell, that's what you're 22 talking about? 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you say "put it back," I am 25 recollection as to whether you've seen it 26 a J don't recall. 27 relatively quickly, but does it jog your 28 recollection as to whether you've seen it 29 a J don't recall.	17		1	
21 computer from Dell, that's what you're 22 talking about? 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you say "put it back," I am 25 recollection as to whether you've seen it 26 a J don't recall. 27 relatively quickly, but does it jog your 28 recollection as to whether you've seen it 29 a J don't recall.	18			
21 computer from Dell, that's what you're 22 talking about? 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you say "put it back," I am 25 recollection as to whether you've seen it 26 a J don't recall. 27 relatively quickly, but does it jog your 28 recollection as to whether you've seen it 29 a J don't recall.	19			-
21 computer from Dell, that's what you're 22 talking about? 23 A Yes. 24 Q When you say "put it back," I am 25 recollection as to whether you've seen it 26 a J don't recall. 27 relatively quickly, but does it jog your 28 recollection as to whether you've seen it 29 a J don't recall.	20		1	
22 talking about? 22 recollection as to whether you've seen it 23 A Yes. 23 before today, Exhibit 17? 24 Q When you say "put it back," I am 24 A I don't recall.	21	computer from Dell, that's what you're		
Q When you say "put it back," I am 24 A I don't recall.	22			
Q When you say "put it back," I am 24 A I don't recall.	23			
	24			
	25	not sure I understand what you mean.	25	MR. BECKERMAN: Mark this as

19 (Pages 70 to 73)

	7	4	76
1 2	W. RAYMOND	1	
3	the next exhibit.	2	
4	[Whereupon, the above mentioned	3	
5	document was marked W. Raymond's	4	you do amigo togother at an
6	Exhibit 19 for identification.]	5	,, ,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,
7	Q Mr. Raymond, I'm showing you	6	
8	what we've marked as Exhibit 19 to your	7	
وا	deposition. I really only have one	8	
10	question to you. It's an e-mail that I	9	the data that was attached to Exhibit 17?
11	sent to Mr. Altman, and I want to know	10	
12	whether you've ever seen this before	11	4
13	(handing).	12	~ · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
14	[Witness peruses the document.]	13	
15	A I don't recall.	14	referring to in Exhibit 20, the document
16	MR. BECKERMAN: Next exhibit,	15	that were attached to Exhibit 17.
17	20.	16 17	A Does the data refer to this? O My quastian is whether it helps
18	[Whereupon, the above mentioned document was marked W. Raymond's	18	Q My question is whether it helps
19	Exhibit 20 for identification.]	19	you jog your recollection that the data you were referring to in your e-mail
20	Q I'm showing you what we marked	20	that's in Exhibit 20 was the documents
21	as Exhibit 20 to your deposition. I know	21	that were attached to Exhibit 17.
22	you don't know well how to read e-mails,	22	A I don't recall.
23	but just so we're good, you see Mr. Altman	23	
24	at the bottom sent me an e-mail on March 9	24	Q Again, I don't want you to guess, but was there any other data that
25	at 10:08 and it says it's Mr. Raymond's	25	you looked at that would have shown
<u> </u>	7:		you looked at that would have shown
1	W. RAYMOND	1	W. RAYMOND
2	response to your letter, and then there's	2	Western Digital data being for an internal
3	a response from me to him. Do you see	3	hard drive.
4	that (handing)?	4	A What was the question?
5	[Witness peruses the document.]	5	Q You referred to the data for
6	A Yes,	6	Western Digital for an internal hard
7	Q That's an e-mail that you sent	7	drive. Was there any other data that you
8	to Mr. Altman, correct?	8	were looking at relating to a Western
9	A It would appear to be an e-mail	9	Digital internal hard drive?
10 11	coming from me.	10	A I don't recall.
12	Q Do you remember writing that	11 12	Q Right above your e-mail to
13	e-mail to Mr. Altman? A I'm not 100 percent sure, but it	13	Mr. Altman and his forwarding an e-mail to
14	A I'm not 100 percent sure, but it does appear I did respond to him.	14	me, and I responded to Mr. Altman. Do you
15	Q You referred in your e-mail to	15	see that? A What was the guestion?
16	the data from Western Digital for an	16	
17	internal hard drive, capitalized. Do you	17	Q I asked if you saw it. My question is: Have you seen my e-mail to
18	see that?	18	Mr. Altman of March 10?
19	A Can I see it?	19	A I don't recall.
20	Q Yes. What data were you	20	Q Mr. Raymond, I'm almost
21	referring to?	21	finished. Look at Exhibit 16, these
22	A I don't recall.	22	pages. It should be in your pile
23	Q If it helps, just to remind you,	23	somewhere. I'll make a representation to
24	if you want to look at the prior Exhibit	24	you, Mr. Raymond, that I believe these to
23 24 25	19, it says I have received a response	25	be screen shots from the hard drive that

21 (Pages 78 to 81)

Okay.

below it. Do you know if any Sony PSP USB

		82		84
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 1	MR. BECKERMAN: I don't. MR. GABRIEL: Mr. Altman, should	82	LITIGATION SUPPORT INDEX DIRECTION TO WITNESS NOT TO Page Line Page Line (None) REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION OF Page Line (None) INFORMATION TO BE PROVICE Page Line (None) QUESTIONS MARKED FOR A REPORT Page Line (None)	TO ANSWER F DOCUMENTS DED
21 22 23 24 25				
		83		85
1 2 3	INDEX		CERTIFICATION	
4	WITNESS EXAMINATION BY PAGE RAYMOND MR. GABRIEL 4		I, BRIAN BRENNER, a Name and within the State of New	
5 6 7			hereby certify: That the witness, WOOD testimony as herein set for	th, was duly
8 9 10 11	EXHIBITS W. RAYMOND DESCRIPTION PAGE 15 Subpoena 19 16 Documents 30 17 Letter 36		sworn by me; and that the transcript is a true record of testimony given by said with I further certify that I an arelated to any of the parties.	of the tness. n not
12 13 14 15	18 Declaration 45 19 E-Mail 74 20 E-Mail 74		related to any of the partie action by blood or marriage in no way interested in the this matter. IN WITNESS WHEREOF,	e, and that I am outcome of
16 17 18 19 20	(All exhibits retained by counsel.)		set my hand this 22nd day	
21 22 23 24 25			BRIAN BRENN	ER

-			
		86	
1 2	ERRATA SHEFT		
3	ERRATA SHEET VERITEXT/NEW YORK REPORTING, LLC		
∦ .	CASE NAME: UMG RECORDING VS. LINDOR DATE OF DEPOSITION: APRIL 22, 2008 WITNESS' NAME: WOODY RAYMOND		
5			
6	PAGE/LINE(S)/ CHANGE REASON	_	
7		_	
	_// <u></u> /	_	
,		_	
10		<u>-</u>	
11		-	
12	<u> </u>	-	
13		-	
14		- -	
15			i
16			
17			
18		:	
19 20			
21	WOODY RAYMOND		
22	SUBSCRIBED AND SWORN TO BEFORE ME THISDAY		
23 24	OF, 2008.		
25	NOTARY PUBLIC		
1			•
l			ļ
li			
1			
		Í	
1			·
Í			
ľ			
			· ·
		į	

23 (Page 86)